

12 March 2019



T Randle

fyi-request-9087-108bbbc7@requests.fyi.org.nz

Private Bag 3038
Waikato Mail Centre
Hamilton 3240, NZ

waikatoregion.govt.nz
0800 800 401

Tēnā koe Tony

REQ141978 – request for information relating to the Hamilton to Auckland start up

Thank you for your request set out below received by Council on **21 November 2018**:

"Dear Waikato Regional Council,

I note the release of the Hamilton to Auckland Start-Up Passenger Rail Service Single Stage Business Case to be decided at tomorrows Waikato Regional Council (WRC) meeting (<https://www.waikatoregion.govt.nz/assets/Uploads/AGENDA-PACKAGE-FOR-COUNCIL-MEETING-21-NOVEMBER-2018.pdf>).

I am interested in how the costs, benefits and cost benefit ratios used in this business case were calculated. I am also interested in how the travel times, patronage and funding estimates were calculated.

- 1) Can I please have a copy of the assumed Hamilton to Britomart Auckland travel times for Long List Option 3 "Connecting bus - limited stops peak" and Option 4 "Connecting bus - all stops peak" listed in "Figure 9-2: Long list screen against investment objectives" on page 108 of the above WRC Agenda ?*
- 2) Can I please have a copy of the assumed Hamilton to Britomart Auckland travel times for the shortlisted Options "Option 10 – Connecting train – higher frequency peak with facilities"; "Option 12 - Connecting train – higher frequency all day with facilities"; and "Option 16 - Through train higher frequency all day with facilities" listed in "Table 9-3: Shortlisted Options " on page 110 of the above WRC Agenda ?*
- 3) Can I please have a copy of the detailed calculations for the Capital Cost totals for each option in "Table 9-4 Shortlisted Options Economic Assessment" on page 112 of the above WRC Agenda ?*
- 4) Can I please have a copy of the detailed calculations for the Operating Cost totals for each option in "Table 9-4 Shortlisted Options Economic Assessment" on page 112 of the above WRC Agenda ?*
- 5) Can I please have a copy of the detailed calculations for the Revenue totals for each option in "Table 9-4 Shortlisted Options Economic Assessment" on page 112 of the above WRC Agenda ?*
- 6) Can I please have a copy of the detailed calculations for the Transport Benefits totals for each option in "Table 9-4 Shortlisted Options Economic Assessment" on page 112 of the above WRC Agenda ?*
- 7) Can I please have a copy of the detailed calculations for the Cost totals for Private Car and Train in "Table 10-11: Train vs private car journey cost comparison" on page 122 of the above WRC Agenda ?*
- 8) Can I please have a copy of the detailed calculations for the Projected Annual Patronage totals in " Figure 10-4: Projected annual patronage volumes (five-year start-up period)" on page 123 of the above WRC Agenda ?*
- 9) Can I please have a copy of the detailed calculations for the Capital Cost totals for in "Table 10-12: Capital Cost Components" on page 124 of the above WRC Agenda ?*
- 10) Can I please have a copy of the detailed calculations for the Operating Cost totals for in "Table 10-13: Operating Cost Components" on page 125 of the above WRC Agenda ?*
- 11) Can I please have a copy of the detailed calculations for the Revenue totals for in "Table 10-14: Indicative Fare Revenue" on page 126 of the above WRC Agenda ?*
- 12) Can I please have a copy of the detailed calculations for the Public Transport User Benefit totals for in "Table 10-15: Public Transport User Benefit Components" on page 127 of the above WRC Agenda ?*

13) Can I please have a copy of the detailed calculations for the Non-user Benefits totals for in "Table 10-16: Non-User Benefit Components" on page 126 of the above WRC Agenda ?

14) Can I please have a copy of the detailed calculations used for the amounts for the four scenarios in "Table 10-18: 30-Year Present Value Benefits, Costs and BCR Outputs" on page 130 of the above WRC Agenda ?

15) Can I please have a copy of the detailed calculations used for the funding amounts in "Table 11-1: Funding Case" on page 134 of the above WRC Agenda ?

I expect this information to be held in electronic form and, if so, I would prefer it was provided in its complete and original electronic format.

Yours faithfully,

Tony Randle

This is an Official Information request made via the FYI website.

Please use this email address for all replies to this request:

fyi-request-9087-108bbbc7@requests.fyi.org.nz

On **7 February 2019** Council responded as follows:

"Please follow the link below to information requested.

[https://waikatorc-](https://waikatorc-my.sharepoint.com/:x/g/personal/sarah_mcleay_waikatoregion_govt_nz/EQZhf3PJ3_9Cp0Cq9Z_qtzwB_ucESp1MllavvoO7i-etPdQ?e=PI097K)

[my.sharepoint.com/:x/g/personal/sarah_mcleay_waikatoregion_govt_nz/EQZhf3PJ3_9Cp0Cq9Z_qtzwB_ucESp1MllavvoO7i-etPdQ?e=PI097K](https://waikatorc-my.sharepoint.com/:x/g/personal/sarah_mcleay_waikatoregion_govt_nz/EQZhf3PJ3_9Cp0Cq9Z_qtzwB_ucESp1MllavvoO7i-etPdQ?e=PI097K)

Some of the information requested does not exist or cannot be found. Question 1 and 2 seek information that wasn't utilized when completing the assessment of the long list of options against the investment objectives. This analysis was a qualitative one (actual travel times weren't computed) that utilized a scoring criteria, which is outlined in page 108 of the Council report. The time benchmarks used were derived from the consultants' previous experience and literature review of previous work that had published travel times for an array of transport options for the Hamilton to Auckland corridor. In addition, the information sought in question 14 is not held by Council. The consultants that led the completion of the SSBC ran a separate economic sensitivity analysis with a set of parameters. This was not retained.

The balance of your request is declined in accordance with section 17(f) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act on the basis that it cannot be met without substantial collation and research having a significant and unreasonable impact on Council's ability to carry out its other operations. To provide further information Council would be required to review and collate (by way of hard coding and link amendment) approximately 200 Excel records each containing a number of cell and spreadsheet interdependencies. A trial of this process has been undertaken and indicates that it would take, as a minimum, 6 minutes per record to complete. This would require a further 20 hours of staff time in addition to 25 hours already spent to supply the information provided. Council notes that:

- the 25 hours already incurred was required to consult with external consultants to obtain records, to read and review information and to collate that information for release to you.*
- charging for the remaining information would not assist in its provision given the need for significant technical understanding of nature of the information requested and Council's electronic filing systems along with difficulty obtaining contracted resource to undertake the work.*

Please contact me should you wish to make a new request that refines the scope of the declined portion of your request to the extent that provision is possible.

You have the right to seek investigation and review by the Ombudsman of this decision. Information about how to make a complaint is available at www.ombudsman.parliament.nz or free phone 0800 802 602.

On **8 February 2019** you telephoned me and requested that Council's relevant technical expert call you to discuss the possible release of a limited quantity of additional information. You indicated that you were not in a position to pay a charge for the receipt of the requested information.

On 27 February 2019 Council's technical expert contacted you and discussed the release of the following information:

1. An excel electronic copy of the values underpinning the demand, financial and economic analyses undertaken for the Single Stage Business Case (excluding commercially sensitive information).
2. An excel electronic copy with the detailed calculations underpinning the demand, financial and economic analyses undertaken for the Single Stage Business Case (excluding the commercially sensitive information).

You acknowledged that the worksheets deleted would generate errors in existing formulas across the second document described above. This would be due to cells within worksheets deleted being referenced in formulas located across other worksheets. The names of the tabs in each workbook will be retained as per the original documents. You confirmed that this was acceptable and would be adequate for your purposes. You confirmed your agreement, as a condition of release, that:

1. You will contact Council in the event that you find any errors across the workbooks provided
2. You use the worksheets solely for the purposes of your analysis and will not share the worksheets with any other person or entity without seeking Council's express permission.

Please refer to the worksheets attached.

You have the right to seek an investigation and review by the Ombudsman of this decision. Information about how to make a complaint is available at www.ombudsman.parliament.nz or Freephone 0800 802 602.

Please contact me if you have any queries.

Nāku, nā



Statutory Processes Advisor
Sarah.mcleay@waikatoregion.govt.nz