

DOIA12130078

27 November 2012

Jonathan Brewer
by email: fyi-request-590-5dc17c2c@requests.fyi.org.nz

Dear Jonathan

OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT REQUEST

I am responding to your email request of 1 October 2012, under the Official Information Act ("the Act"), for the following information:

"Please publish any and all details of this committee's [Rural Broadband Initiative National Advisory Committee] membership, its budget, any meetings it has held (including minutes), and recommendations or reports it has made to the government on the RBI since the formation of the committee."

I have located five documents related to your request. The documents in question are:

- a. RBI National Advisory Committee - members and biographies
- b. Minutes of the meeting held 4 July 2011
- c. Minutes of the meeting held 5 September 2011
- d. Minutes of the meeting held 30 March 2012
- e. Minutes of the meeting held 13 September 2012

Copies of these five documents are included for your use. Please note that we have withheld some information in documents 'b', 'c', 'd', and 'e' for the following reasons:

Section 9(2)(g)(i) of the Act

In documents 'b' and 'e' some information has been withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i) of the Act. This is necessary to maintain the effective conduct of public affairs through the free and frank expression of opinions by or between or to Ministers of the Crown or members of an organisation in the course of their duty.

Section 9(2)(b)(ii) of the Act

In documents 'd' and 'e' information has been withheld under section 9(2)(b)(ii) of the Act. This is necessary to protect information where the making available of the information would be likely unreasonably to prejudice the commercial position of the person who supplied or who is the subject of information.

Section 9(2)(ba)(i) of the Act

In documents 'c', 'd' and 'e' some information has been withheld under section 9(2)(ba)(i). The withholding of information is necessary to protect information which is subject to an obligation of confidence or where the making available of the information would be likely to prejudice the supply of similar information from the same source, and it is in the public interest that such information should continue to be supplied.

Section 9(2)(j) of the Act

In document 'e' information has been withheld under section 9(2)(j) of the Act to enable a Minister of the Crown or any department or organisation holding the information to carry on, without prejudice or disadvantage, negotiations (including commercial and industrial negotiations).

Section 9(2)(a) of the Act

In documents 'b', 'c', 'd', and 'e' we have withheld some information under section 9(2)(a) of the Act to protect the privacy of natural persons.

Additional comment for document 'c'

You may wish to note that in document 'c', under Point 4 on page 2 there is a discussion on other issues that could potentially cause connectivity delays with schools. The paragraph incorrectly states schools are expected to commit a 20% contribution towards the drop costs. State and state integrated schools have never been required to contribute towards the drop costs.

Budget information

On your request for budget information, we advise the RBI Advisory Committee does not run a formal budget process but funding of the meetings is shared between the three partners; Chorus, Vodafone and the Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment. Total costs shared between the parties for the four meetings to date are as follows:

- July 2011: \$10,173.20
- September 2011: \$9,364.64
- February 2012: \$10,872.83
- September 2012: \$5,640.95

The last meeting was held in September 2012 and was held using Chorus Smart Meeting rooms in Auckland, Wellington and Christchurch meaning that travel costs for the meeting were substantially reduced leading to the reduced overall cost for the meeting.

Recommendations and reports to government

The RBI National Advisory Committee has made no recommendations to the government, nor compiled any reports.

I am satisfied that, in terms of section 9(1) of the Act, in the circumstances of this case, the withholding of the information referred to above is not outweighed by other considerations which render it desirable in the public interest to make the information available.

You have the right by way of complaint under section 28(3) of the Act to an Ombudsman, to seek an investigation and review of my refusal to release the information.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Brad Ward', with a stylized flourish at the end.

Brad Ward
Manager, Communications & IT Policy
Resources, Energy and Communications Branch
Infrastructure and Resource Markets Group

Attached

RBI National Advisory Group members

Graeme Milne

Graeme Milne is a professional director who has a background working in the New Zealand dairy industry. Currently he is the chair of the Waikato District Health Board and four New Zealand based companies, and holds directorships in four others.

Donald Aubrey

Donald Aubrey is a High Country Farmer from South Canterbury who is the former Vice-President and national telecommunications spokesperson for Federated Farmers.

Traci Houpapa

Traci Houpapa is the Chair of the Federation of Maori Authorities and a Director of Landcorp. She also holds appointments on a number of Maori authorities and private sector companies.

Kevin Loe

Kevin Loe is a South Island sheep and beef farmer who is a director of a number of companies involved in rural business activities. He is also actively involved in a number of community organisations and activities.

Dr Joseph Scott-Jones

Dr Joseph Scott-Jones is a General Practitioner in Opotiki who is the current chair of the NZ Rural General Practice Network. He is also a director of the Eastern Bay of Plenty Primary Health Alliance (PHO).

Ben Smith

Ben Smith is a dairy farmer from Northland. He was the founding Chairman of the Northland Community Foundation and is currently a Trustee of the New Zealand New Leaders Foundation Charitable Trust.

Jacky Stafford

Jacky Stafford is a former National Councillor of Rural Women NZ. She is also a board member on both the NZ School Trustees Association, and Te Aho O Te Kura Pounamo (The Correspondence School) and is involved in other education organisations.

Cathy Brown

Cathy Brown is currently the Deputy Chair of the Dairy Women's Network. She has 25 years experience in the dairy industry and is currently also involved in the kiwifruit and avocado industry.

Rob Ford

Rob Ford is the General Manager Farm Systems at the Livestock Improvement Corporation (LIC). He has responsibility for the strategy, development and deployment of all customer software for LIC.

Richard Orzecki

Richard Orzecki is a member of Ngā Pū Waea, the National Maori Broadband Working Group.

Antony Royal

Antony Royal is a member of Ngā Pū Waea, the National Maori Broadband Working Group. He has more than 20 years experience consulting in the IT industry, is a trustee on Te Huarahi Tika Trust (Maori Spectrum Trust) and is a Director of Hautaki Ltd., which manages the Maori investment in 2 Degrees Mobile.

RELEASED UNDER THE
OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT

RBI National Advisory Committee – minutes of meeting

Monday, 4 July
9:30am – 12.00pm
Ngata Room, Level 1
Ministry of Economic Development
33 Bowen Street, Wellington

Attendees

Members of the Committee

Donald Aubrey, Kevin Loe, Dr Joseph Scott Jones, Ben Smith, Jacky Stafford, Cathy Brown, Rob Ford, Antony Royal, Jeremy Gardiner.

Ex-officio members of the Committee

[s9(2)(a) – MED member(s)]

[s9(2)(a) – Chorus member(s)]

[s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member(s)]

MED

[s9(2)(a) – MED member(s)]

Telecom

[s9(2)(a) – Telecom member(s)]

Vodafone

[s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member(s)]

Apologies

Members of the Committee

Graeme Milne, Traci Houpapa

1. Opening / welcome from Minister

The meeting was opened by the Chair with a welcome and introductions of the Committee members. Apologies were taken for Graeme Milne and Traci Houpapa.

The Chair then introduced Minister Steven Joyce. The Minister thanked the Committee for accepting the invitation to join the Committee and set out his expectations of the Committee. He gave a short overview of the Government's 5 point plan to encourage uptake of ultrafast broadband, being coordinated through MED but involving multiple agencies. It was the Minister's view that the National Advisory Committee would play a key role in feeding back into the Government's objectives for rolling out broadband to rural NZ. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] noted the challenges the RBI partners would face in managing customer expectations. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] illustrated this around the matter of mobile coverage, noting that while only 1.3% of customers would not be in the Vodafone coverage area, this represented approximately half of the landmass of New Zealand.

2. Overview of the National Advisory Committee

The Chair provided an overview of the Committee, its purpose and its roles and responsibilities (refer attached presentation). The parameters of the Committee's composition and membership were outlined and it was reiterated by the Chair that

Committee Members were there to represent the views and expectations of national stakeholders, from a rural user perspective, in relation to the RBI. It was noted that Telecom would be providing the Secretariat for the Committee.

3. Matters for Consideration

- Terms of Reference

The Chair asked for comments on the draft Terms of Reference. Clarification was sought from [s9(2)(a) – Ngā Pū Waea member] re. the role of Ngā Pū Waea on the Committee and noted that as their appointed representatives, they will be more focused on representing the interests of Māori – unlike other Members who will be representing the broader interests of rural users. The Chair noted this.

Members also sought clarification on the role of the RBI Partners as ex-officio members. The Chair and [s9(2)(a) – Telecom member] reiterated the desire to include the CEOs of the RBI partners in Committee discussions but that they will not hold voting powers. The Committee noted that officials and staff from RBI partners will be required to attend meetings to provide advice on particular matters.

The Chair moved that the draft Terms of Reference be approved. Motion carried.

- Review of Interests Register

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] noted that [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] may need to declare further interests to the Secretariat following the meeting.

The Chair moved the Interests Register be approved. Motion carried

- Appointment of Chairperson

Two options for the appointment of the Chairperson were presented to the Committee (refer attached presentation). The Chair noted that it was the RBI partners desire to have a chairperson in place for the second meeting of the Committee.

The Committee were interested in the RBI partners' view on who a suitable Chairperson would be. [s9(2)(a) – MED and Telecom members] noted that no thinking had been done on this yet. Committee Members felt that, given they were relatively unfamiliar with one another, that it would be more appropriate for the RBI partners to provide a recommendation to Committee Members with a view to electing a Chairperson by postal ballot. It was agreed that the Secretariat would co-ordinate this.

Action for follow-up:

- *RBI partners to provide a recommendation for a Chairperson to Committee Members.*
- *Secretariat to co-ordinate votes by postal ballot.*

4. Telecom and Vodafone's RBI solution

The Chair outlined the Government's strategy for delivering broadband to rural communities and noted that the RBI contract awarded to Telecom and Vodafone was effectively the first phase of the roll out. Phase 2 would be to reach out to those 60 schools in very remote areas that would not be covered by Telecom and the remaining 301 Zone 3 schools not covered under the existing RBI contract with telecom. The Chair

said that it was the Government's intention to open a tender process for this work programme by the end of July and that the rollout of this phase will match the RBI and UFB schedules in terms of the schools targets i.e. build to start in January 2012 with completion by July 2016.

[s9(2)(a) – Telecom and Vodafone members] then outlined the RBI solution proposed by the two companies; the build programme and the national rollout plan (refer attached presentation).

Discussion was held around Vodafone's use of wireless towers to deliver the community broadband objectives and what the reception had been from Councils during the regional stakeholder engagement process to this. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] said that two tower options had been presented to Councils and that their reaction had generally been positive, however he noted the possibility that some plans could still be turned down when they came up for approval. [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] noted that Councils are taking a much stronger economic development focus to their district planning and should be much more open to the idea of new towers in the areas. Members said that the National Advisory Committee could have a role in assisting with the approval process through leveraging their contacts with Councils. The RBI partners agreed that they would like the Committee to facilitate this if required.

There was some discussion amongst the Committee regarding broadband speed targets under the RBI and clarification was sought on what the speed improvements mean and how they stack up against current benchmarks. [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] noted that the current determination of peak and off-peak broadband speeds, while applicable to urban centres, may not hold for rural communities with many working late at home in the evenings. This needed to be borne in mind when communicating average speed improvements under the RBI.

5. Conclusions from the first round of regional stakeholder engagement

[s9(2)(a) – Telecom and Vodafone members] outlined the conclusions from the completed first round of regional stakeholder engagement. Overall the sense from the RBI partners was that they had been successful and were well received by the community. However, it was reiterated that the sense of good will would be tested when the actual build programme begins. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] noted there were opportunities for local ISPs to extend coverage even further than the RBI target coverage area and that some who had participated in the meetings had already indicated they were interested in doing so.

There was some discussion amongst Committee Members regarding the wholesale market and how ISPs would purchase access to the network. [s9(2)(a) – Telecom member] noted that some of the smaller ISPs may not be of sufficient scale initially to purchase from Telecom Wholesale although the market was expected to develop over time to allow them to do so either directly or indirectly.

Committee Members discussed what local employment opportunities would be created under the RBI. [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] noted that much of the build programme will use the same workforce currently being deployed under Chorus' Fibre to the Node Programme, although there will be some demand at the local level for low-skilled workers to assist with the civil build works.

6. Broadband usage and uptake / issues and opportunities

[s9(2)(a) – Vodafone and Telecom members] outlined the main issues and opportunities identified through the regional stakeholder engagement programme (refer attached presentation).

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] enquired as to what happens with cost savings that have been achieved in the rollout. The RBI partners confirmed that savings from a region that are attributable to regional collaboration will be reinvested to extend the RBI further in that particular region. The mechanism for this still needed to be developed.

[s9(2)(a) – Ngā Pū Waea member] enquired about the Ministry of Education's Schools Network Upgrade Project (SNUP) and whether this would slow down the delivery and uptake of the RBI. The Chair noted that the MOE has six years to upgrade all schools' internal networks but that it needs to be timed with the fibre rollout so that schools have the capability to use it when it is delivered. The Chair said up to 2,000 schools nationwide need to have their internal networks upgraded.

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] noted the challenges of driving a culture change in some schools. The Chair agreed and noted that MOE are working to teach schools how to use the new technologies and that the process would be largely iterative. [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] noted that many rural schools don't even know that fast broadband is coming and that a lack of MoE funding is a barrier to driving uptake. The RBI partners noted that there is a large amount of work that will have to be undertaken to drive capability and uptake.

7. Overview of Ngā Pū Waea

[s9(2)(a) – Ngā Pū Waea member] gave a brief overview of Ngā Pū Waea, the National Māori Broadband Working Group. He noted that it was set up to address the digital divide with Māori in relation to the RBI and UFB with four key areas of focus: connectivity – mapping who's missing out and what can be done to improve this; affordability; leveraging opportunities to get better value/returns from the UFB and RBI in terms of upskilling and job creation amongst Māori; and, simulating demand on the user side.

It was noted by the Committee that many of the issues facing Māori are the same as those in rural communities and that there is significant cross over between the two work programmes.

8. Discussion

An open discussion was held amongst the Committee regarding affordability constraints that may limit uptake of broadband. It was noted that rural communities don't expect Government subsidies to address the question of affordability and [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] said that farmers can be quick to take up new technologies and that affordability can improve pretty quickly over time. [s9(2)(a) – Ngā Pū Waea member] said that Ngā Pū Waea's focus is programme specific and that Government intervention is still required to deal with affordability issues for Māori. [s9(2)(a) – Ngā Pū Waea member] reiterated this point, noting that the huge savings that can be made (eg. remote diabetes health management) and that relevant Government agencies such as the Ministry of Health should recognise this in subsidising uptake for Māori. [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] noted the experience of the Correspondence School, where many students attended classes in clusters and don't have computers at home. The

challenge therefore was one of stimulating youth uptake in their class settings to compel their parents to take up broadband at home.

The Chair then outlined the Government's 5 point action plan on stimulating demand and uptake of broadband to be launched in late August by the Minister. The MED's intention of the action plan was to clarify what role the Government has to encourage this, while noting that the sector also has a commercial interest in driving uptake as well. The action plan has 5 key areas of focus: e-Education, e-Health, e-Government, e-Business and e-Development.

With regard to e-Education, the Chair noted that the Government is keen to encourage uptake from schools. An option of a RFP is being considered to develop a managed/shared network for schools.

Regarding e-Government, [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] noted the inconsistencies with government investing in a fibre network and shared platforms but then giving government agencies the option to opt out of participating. It was the view of some on the Committee that the government must have a role in pushing this and could do so in some areas where Central government has a contractual relationship e.g. the Ministry of Health's contracts with PHO's. [WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(g)(i)]

The Committee noted the Government's desire to encourage take up of broadband amongst SME's and the wider community. [WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(g)(i)]

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] noted that rural communities will engage but local ISPs need to be constructive on how they engage with rural people.

The MED gave some details of the 5 point plan introduced earlier by the Minister and said the Committee could have a role in inputting into the 5 point plan. [s9(2)(a) – Telecom member] noted that the RBI partners' intention is to have the work programme driven through the Chairperson and it was agreed by the Committee to wait until the appointment had been made before determining that programme.

9. Any other business

Some further discussion was held re: the role and programme of work that the Committee would be undertaking and how feasible its operation could be with meetings held only six-monthly. The RBI partners agreed that the next meeting of the Committee should be held in the next 6/8 weeks by which a Chairperson would be elected and a work programme can be developed.

Action for follow-up:

- *Secretariat to make arrangements for the next meeting of the Committee, scheduled for late August in Wellington.*

Meeting closed at 12.00pm.

RBI National Advisory Committee – minutes of meeting

Monday, 5 September 2011
9:30am – 12.30pm
Ngata Room, Level 1
Ministry of Economic Development
33 Bowen Street, Wellington

Attendees

Members of the Committee

Graeme Milne (Chair), Donald Aubrey, Kevin Loe, Ben Smith, Jacky Stafford, Cathy Brown, Rob Ford, Antony Royal, Tracy Houppapa, Dr Joseph Scott Jones (by audio conference), Jeremy Gardiner (by audio conference)

Ex-officio members of the Committee

[s9(2)(a) – Chorus member(s)], [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member(s)], [s9(2)(a) – MED member(s)]

MED

[s9(2)(a) – MED member(s)]

Telecom

[s9(2)(a) – Telecom member(s)]

Vodafone

[s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member(s)]

Apologies

[s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member(s)], [s9(2)(a) – MED member(s)]

1. Introductions/Apologies

There were technical difficulties with the videoconferencing link with the Te Runanga o Ngati Awa offices and a voice conference was set up to enable Dr Joseph Scott Jones and Jeremy Gardiner to join the meeting.

The Chair opened the meeting and gave a meeting brief summary of his connection to the rural community. The committee members followed suit with similar introductions.

2. Review of Minutes

Minutes from the 4 July meeting were reviewed and agreed. Moved [s9(2)(a) – Ngā Pū Waea member], seconded [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member].

3. Review of Interests Register

The following items were added to the interest register:

Graeme Milne: member of Red Meat Sector Strategy Coordination Group

Traci Houppapa: member of MAF Global Strategic Initiative group

Antony Royal: director of Smartlinx 3

4. Telecom and Vodafone's RBI update

[s9(2)(a) – Telecom member] led the update on RBI progress to date noting that due to change requests the Telecom project scope now includes an additional 105 Zone 3 schools and confirmed this was still within the original \$285m funding. The rationale for the additional schools was by cost/size ration and where there was an opportunity to connect several schools within any given area. One example was Bay of Plenty where all but one school will now be connected to ultra-fast broadband. There was also a particular focus on North Otago and Canterbury.

A new Chorus brochure was introduced to the committee as part of the RBI communications plan. The brochure is being distributed through letter box drops in areas where RBI is beginning to roll out. An issue with the response time from schools to approve design of the fibre drop has already been noticed.

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] cited the example of Pahioia School which is known to her where fibre is already in place but she understood it would be another two years before the school was connected.

The committee asked for clarity on the processes within schools, the Ministry of Education and between them and Telecom around the RBI rollout expressing concern if there were delays between fibre being laid and schools having their internal networks upgraded through the Schools Network Upgrade Programme (SNUP).

[s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] confirmed that Chorus liaises with MoE on the rollout schedule but there is a potential for misalignment in areas where fibre is already being deployed and schools along that route are connected ahead of their SNUP upgrades.

Action

[s9(2)(a) – MED member] *to follow up with Ministry of Education for clarity on their processes and communications to schools around connectivity*

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] *to follow up with Pahioia School*

There was a discussion on other issues that could potentially cause connectivity delays with schools. It was believed that some schools are taking the fibre drop design sign off process to their Board of Trustees which causes delays in turnaround time. There could also be a reluctance from some school Boards to commit the 20% contribution they are required to make towards the drop costs and the Committee questioned whether schools are fully aware of the benefits of fibre. The Chair believed this was an opportunity for the committee to get involved and asked for a list of schools before the next meeting, where fibre had been deployed under RBI but there were delays with the fibre drop being deployed.

The Chair noted the importance of understanding the root cause of these issues – are they do with processes, or communications, or level of awareness or finances etc. A survey of schools could be a good way to understand this.

Action

[s9(2)(a) – MED member] *to invite Ministry of Education to provide an update at the next meeting*

Telecom to provide a list of schools where delays are occurring and consider a survey to understand reasons for these delays.

[s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] [WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(ba)(i)]

The first site will be completed in November this year in Puketaha. As well as building 154 new towers, Vodafone will be upgrading 387 existing ones with a selection already completed in Taumaranui, Stratford and Wairoa. These sites have been successfully tested and exceed expectations in terms of speeds. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] confirmed that by providing wireless broadband there is the additional benefit of improved mobile coverage. Vodafone will release their retail pricing in November and it was confirmed that as part of the Undertakings Vodafone are required to offer a wholesale price for the next seven years. The committee were keen to get an idea of the pricing packages that would be available to customers.

Action

Vodafone to provide a range of rural pricing offers at the next meeting

[s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] introduced the coverage maps which are available on the Vodafone website, where the user is able to enter their address and see whether they will have improved broadband under RBI. The Chair asked for maps of the country split into regions with more detail on the rollout plans to be made available to the committee. He was keen to see a simple representation of progress on the rollout, including future projects, for both the Telecom and Vodafone deliverables for RBI.

Action

Vodafone to provide 15 regional maps to the committee before the next meeting

There was a discussion amongst the Committee about the role they were expected to play in helping resolve local deployment issues. Telecom reiterated their view that the vehicle for addressing such issues would be through the regional stakeholder groups but if committee members wished to be involved and had contacts they could leverage we would be grateful for their help. But this would not be a requirement for committee members. Similarly committee members may like to attend regional stakeholder group meetings or other meetings between key stakeholders and the RBI partners.

MED pointed out they are also developing an online tool 'Broadband Finder' which will be available in October to assist people with their broadband queries and help them to identify which service provider to contact and which of the two broadband initiatives (UFB & RBI) they might fall under.

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] referred back to the Telecom update and questioned whether Telecom believed they were siting cabinets and fibre in the most effective way to allow access for health providers. [s9(2)(a) – Telecom member] responded that although the primary focus was to connect the schools, if there were points of interest along the fibre route it was sensible to plan for these in the rollout. He welcomed any feedback from the committee on a better way to identify key points of interest.

To [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] question on the connected health standards [s9(2)(a) – MED member] noted this was more a matter for the retail service providers but that the RBI and UFB architecture would not be incompatible with these standards.

Action

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] to provide Telecom with information on the addresses of rural health services

5. MED update

[s9(2)(a) – MED member] presented the MED update on the remaining phases of the RBI procurement process. He was confident all remaining schools could be connected with the funds available and that the 60 remote schools could be connected to a minimum 10Mb/s service at an attractive price from early 2012 on. He noted that connecting these schools through wireless solutions was not necessarily dependent on fibre availability in the area. Once the procurement process is complete we will be on track to have 97.5% of New Zealand schools connected to fibre in the next five years.

The Phase 2 procurement process sought to stretch the funding pot further by including some health sites and library sites. MED are confident these can also be connected within the existing funding.

[s9(2)(a) – MED member] mentioned there could possibly be surplus once RBI was completed, and was interested in the committee's thoughts on how this surplus could be spent. There was no need for a contingency in the funding as the risks of overspend are borne by the RBI partners, not the MED.

Action

Committee to discuss priorities for use of any underspend in RBI contracts.

6. Discussion on scoping paper

After morning tea the committee engaged a discussion around the scoping paper drafted by the Chair to confirm the roles and responsibilities of the committee. The Chair talked through his initial thoughts and the five key areas of work he felt the committee should focus on: Advocacy, Advisory, Education, Monitoring and Government Liaison and asked for feedback from the rest of the committee.

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] voiced his concerns on the role of the committee and felt it would be difficult to meet expectations if the committee was only convening every six months. The group then discussed what was realistic to achieve with these timeframes. It was agreed that the committee should email as and when necessary with any questions they may have or any issues they are aware of and that all parties should be copied in on all correspondence. It was also agreed that a quarterly update would be provided on the RBI rollout from the partners, and that MED would provide more information on the possible contract underspend.

Action

MED, Telecom and Vodafone to provide quarterly updates to the committee

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] reiterated his concerns around the role of the committee and requested clarity, particularly in terms of advocacy which he felt was the responsibility of the partners and service providers. The Chair confirmed that it was the role of the partners to ensure the RBI was adequately promoted in rural communities but it was the role of the committee to ensure this activity was effectively taking place. Telecom added there was an expectation that specific community concerns would be raised at the regional stakeholder meetings and not directly with committee members.

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] raised the point that there should be an overall awareness/communications plan for RBI and the benefits it held for rural New Zealand made available for the committee to advise on and for members to refer to when engaging within their own communities. This prompted the question of who the

responsibility lay with for informing rural New Zealand of the RBI. [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] pointed out that throughout Chorus's fibre to the node programme there was full reliance on the retail providers to promote FTTN to their customers which did not prove adequate and there was a need to find a better way. The Chair agreed there was a definite need for a discussion on the status of the RBI communications at the next meeting.

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] reiterated the need for committee members to understand the key messages of RBI in order to perform an effective advocacy role and feed back a consistent message to their communities. This prompted further discussion around where the responsibilities lay for promotion. The question was raised whether this should sit with MED as a government department and therefore non biased and although [s9(2)(a) – MED member] agreed MED were able to do some promotion he believed the providers were the ones with the commercial incentive to promote RBI not MED. [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] asked for clarity on the responsibility of the committee to promote RBI and whether the group were responsible for advocating take up with the schools and medical facilities etc. The Chair believed this was the role of the retailer providers and that responsibility of the committee lay with promoting capability. [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] felt there were communications channels across the committee that could be utilised [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] noting that he had already informed 10,000 dairy farmers of his role on the committee and he expected to be their point of contact on any relevant issues they were facing. MED added that their broadband portal would be available from October and that this would include information on the benefits of RBI.

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] *left the meeting at midday*

The Chair reiterated that the focus of the committee was to promote the capability of RBI.

The group discussed the timing of the next meetings with February/March and Aug/September the preferred months with exact dates to be confirmed by the end of September. It was agreed Vodafone, Telecom and MED would provide an RBI rollout update before Christmas.

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] brought the group's attention to the TUANZ Rural Broadband Symposium which will be held between 8-9 November in Taupo with a suggestion that the committee should be represented. Telecom supported this and asked for suggestions on any other events where the committee felt they should be present. It was noted that the FOMA conference immediately follows TUANZ on 11 November.

The Chair was able to attend the TUANZ events and agreed to wait for further advice from the partners.

Meeting closed at 12.11pm.

**RBI National Advisory Committee Meeting
Minutes of meeting**

Friday 30 March 2012
10am – 12:30pm
Chorus House
66 Wyndham Street
Auckland

Attendees

Committee: Graeme Milne (Chair), Donald Aubrey, Ben Smith, Jacky Stafford, Cathy Brown, Antony Royal, Richard Orzecki, Traci Houpapa and Dr Jo Scott-Jones via audio.

Ex-officio members of the Committee

[s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member(s)], [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member(s)] (from 11:30am), [s9(2)(a) – MED member(s)]

MED

[s9(2)(a) – MED member(s)]

Vodafone

[s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member(s)]

Chorus

[s9(2)(a) – Chorus member(s)]

Apologies

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member(s)], [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member].

1. Review of previous minutes

Previous minutes were moved by [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member], seconded by [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member].

ACTION: Review of interest register – could all Members provide their interests to [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member]. The register will then be circulated, and from then on only changes reported.

Actions from previous minutes:

[s9(2)(a) – MED member] followed up with Ministry of Education for clarity on their processes and communications to schools around connectivity. One point to be corrected, there is no 20% contribution expected from schools as fibre drops are fully funded. The Ministry of Education RFP for 'Network for Learning' is being released within the next four weeks. [WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(b)(ii)]

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] confirmed that she had been in contact with the Pahioa School Principal in regards to the action.

Vodafone provided regional maps to the group after the previous meeting. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] will present pricing information at today's meeting.

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] provided Telecom with the information on addresses of rural health services. [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] to ascertain where that list was sent on to within Telecom/Chorus.

2. Vodafone update

[s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] presented Vodafone’s progress to date.

- Vodafone and Chorus are into their second round of RBI consultation, travelling around the country. Attendance has been low, with some areas having around 15 people attending, and others less than 5.
- Discussion around how to make good progress with councils, and that you really need a champion within the office.
- Deployment in Puketaha is via lattice tower. Lattice towers are the standard in the UK, are more cost effective and efficient. They are best for co-location, suit windy sites and much easier for technicians to work with. However, most councils prefer single mast towers, despite understanding the limitations, but this does mean they are easier to get resource consent for. [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] asked whether Vodafone was compromising future plans by using single mast towers; [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] said that if the towers were built in the right way they can be expanded so no.
- There was quite a discussion around how to improve regional stakeholder engagement given the low turnout at the second round of consultation which ends next week. We need to work out who the right people are to engage in the process. No public notification process is currently in place. Chorus acknowledges that through demerger we have lost some capability in community relationships and are currently rebuilding. Chorus are looking for any suggestions the Committee can provide.
- [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] suggested we invite the health community as they are desperate for coverage.
- [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] said we were losing a good opportunity, and we really need to engage with the people that actually drive uptake.
- [s9(2)(a) – Ngā Pū Waea member] said that Ngā Pū Waea might be interested in providing leadership for the next round of consultation with a view to targetting Maori communities.
- Chorus is looking for any opportunities to help us rebuild our relationships in communities for better regional stakeholder engagement. Everyone agrees there are a lot of groups that we could work through. [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] suggesting public notifications.

ACTION: Committee to put forward their suggested parties once meetings and dates are known.

- [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] acknowledged that there have been some learning’s for Vodafone on how best to engage with the rural community. [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] said that Farmers Weekly was the best way of reaching the community, and the Committee agreed.
- The Vodafone Community Cell Site Scheme was positively received by communities. [s9(2)(a) – MED member] was interested in learning more. The Scheme is creating demand, and [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] noted that there was a lot of positive stimulation in the health sector in Northland.
- Vodafone’s Retail Wireless Broadband Plans were presented. It is noted that this service is not built for high usage for things such as streaming movies. Current average usage is 5GB per month, but growing each year.

3. Chorus update

[s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] presented Chorus’ progress to date.

- [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] asked how people get service when they see the fibre go past their home. [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] explained that Chorus is not a retail service provider (RSP), and that the RSP are the ones that need to approach end users. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] commented that Chorus needed to develop its final product set for RSP's to sell first. [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] explained that Chorus is working on its rural strategy, and this was hoped to be done in the next couple of months. [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] highlighted that environmental aspects must be considered.
- Some numbers in the pack were verbally updated at the meeting.
 - There are now 218 rural schools ready for service, which is fibre is installed right into the building. [s9(2)(a) – MED member] advised that the Ministry of Education must have all schools SNUPped by end of 2016.
 - 98 rural cabinets are now installed and are ready for service.

ACTION: [WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(ba)(i)]

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] and [s9(2)(a) – MED member] both have connections at MoH. The Committee would like this followed up on because the rural health sector desperate for service.

ACTION: [WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(ba)(i)]

ACTION: [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] to report back on how many ports in a cabinet. [s9(2)(a) – MED member] would like to know the number of premises, as opposed to just ports.

ACTION: [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] to send the hard copy report of maps and schools to [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member(s)].

ACTION: [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] to send RBI Phase 2 RFP to show included schools and health facilities.

General discussion

In response to whether there was anything not covered in today's discussion as to this groups function.

- [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] asked whether Chorus was going to lead the updating of this process, or MED? Is there an opportunity for public to have input? [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] agreeing to take leadership.
- [s9(2)(a) – Ngā Pū Waea member] wanted to let the Committee know about a project that Ngā Pū Waea is kicking off on use of the internet and invited comments.
- [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] talked about the large demand within the teaching community to have electronic notifications for parents. [s9(2)(a) – MED member] suggested research groups such as Roy Morgan who can help with base line information. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] is happy to assist.
- [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] requested an update report quarterly. He asked that the Members please copy everyone in the Committee in if you have a question. Next quarterly update is in June, with the next face to face meeting in September.

- Chorus will investigate the use of Chorus' Smart Meeting rooms for September meeting.

ACTION: For future meetings, Chorus and Vodafone were asked to ensure papers are sent out at least 3-4 days in advance, although it is acknowledged that there is need to have up to date information in them.

ACTION: Minutes to be sent to Committee within two weeks of today's meeting.

ACTION: [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] to send Committee confirmation of Honorarium rate, mileage rate, and information where to send invoices for reimbursement.

RELEASED UNDER THE
OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT

**RBI National Advisory Committee Meeting
Minutes of meeting**

Thursday 13 September
10am – 12:00pm
By Smart Meeting Room
Chorus Offices,
Auckland, Wellington and Christchurch

Attendees

Committee: Graeme Milne (Chair), Donald Aubrey, Ben Smith, Jacky Stafford, Cathy Brown, Kevin Loe, Richard Orzecki via audio.

Ex-officio members of the Committee

[s9(2)(a) – Chorus member], [s9(2)(a) – MBIE member]

MBIE

[s9(2)(a) – MBIE member(s)]

Vodafone

[s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member(s)]

Chorus

[s9(2)(a) – Chorus member(s)]

Ministry of Education

[s9(2)(a) – Ministry of Education member(s)]

Apologies

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member], [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member], [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member], [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member], [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] joined meeting briefly to give his apologies.

1. Review of previous minutes

Previous minutes were moved by [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member], seconded by [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member].

No members came forward with any changes to the interest register. Cathy Brown declared that she has joined the Western Bay of Plenty region working group for broadband.

ACTION: [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] to circulate the original list and members to send their interests and in future it will be circulated on an annual basis.

Actions from Previous meeting:

- The Committee were to put forward their suggested parties once meetings and dates are known. This is an ongoing action. When a local meeting is being organised, please ask the local Committee Member if they wish to suggest any interested parties. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] also advised that Vodafone are about to start a big run of meetings.
- [WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(ba)(i) [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] and [s9(2)(a) – MBIE member] both have

connections at MoH. The Committee wanted this followed up on because the rural health sector had specific requirements for service. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] reported that Vodafone have good engagement with [s9(2)(a) – Ministry of Health member] at Ministry of Health. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] has had a meeting with [s9(2)(a) – Ministry of Health member] where he told him about this group, and how the Committee are very keen for the Ministry of Health to get something up and running. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] reported that Vodafone have been talking with the GP Rural Network about sponsoring their conference in Rotorua. Chorus are also interested in being involved. [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] commented that there has been a lot of engagement with the health sector particularly with the Fonterra Milk in Schools programme with Manaia Health. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] reported that mobile health is starting to ramp up and Vodafone being a mobile company; it is something they are very interested in. [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] commented that Rural Women NZ own a growing home care business, and particularly need access. They have an increasing use of technology in their business, to stay in contact with network of carers. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] asked if the home care organisation was in contact with the NZ Telehealth Forum who are working on these kinds of issues. [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] was on the Board a couple of years ago, and is confident that they are looking into it and has suggested contacts to them.

ACTION: [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] will follow up with the NZ Telehealth Forum to ensure that they are in contact with right people.

- [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] was to report back on research of what the technology is in schools and what the possible health risks are. Some parents have concerns around wireless in the schoolroom. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] reported that Vodafone don't have any specific analysis on schools, but have a lot of material on general mobile frequency health analysis. There is no evidence that there is any risk. It is a 20 year old technology and there is no evidence that it is not perfectly safe. In the realms of another 10-20 years there might be some evidence. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] reported on international research that has come out of the UK which was done by an independent researcher into radio frequency. They looked at historical research done over the last 15 years. This comprehensive report came to the conclusion that there are no ill-health effects on adults or children. This has been accepted by the industry worldwide. Vodafone's global network has access to all research and watch closely.

ACTION: [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] will send the Committee the link to the research.

[WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(ba)(i)]

[s9(2)(a) – Ministry of Education member] **joined the meeting at 10:30am**

- [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] was to report back on how many ports in a cabinet. [s9(2)(a) – MBIE member] also wanted to know the number of premises, as opposed to just ports. [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] advised that currently deployment in the rural sector is the Eaton-built Whisper cabinet, which was also used in urban areas for FTTN programme.

Provides 384 broadband customers, and current deployment has a minimum of 144 lines capacity in a cabinet. The new Bullet cabinets are half the size and will go in where no RSPs have shown interest in unbundling at a later date. The smaller cabinet provides service for 192 customers and the provisioning rules always ensure enough broadband capacity in a cabinet that matches at least the number of voice connections that are off that site. For example if there are 120 voice connections at that point, we will put 120 broadband to meet future demand. There is no minimum on a Bullet cabinet, we will just deploy based on the phone lines. Bullet cabinets in rural areas come with battery units.

- [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] was to send the hard copy report of maps and schools to [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member], [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member], [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] and [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member]. Completed.
- [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] was to send RBI Phase 2 RFP to show included schools and health facilities. Completed.
- For future meetings, Chorus and Vodafone were asked to ensure papers are sent out at least 3-4 days in advance, although it is acknowledged that there is need to have up to date information in them. [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] apologised for Chorus for not circulating papers 3-4 days in advance, this hold up was due to Chorus late in finalising numbers for today's meeting. Vodafone's papers were not an issue.
- Minutes were to be sent to Committee within two weeks of today's meeting. Completed.
- [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] was to send Committee confirmation of Honorarium rate, mileage rate, and information where to send invoices for reimbursement. Completed. Please note the new instructions that were circulated recently where a deposit slip was required for Chorus audit requirements.

VODAFONE UPDATE

[WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(ba)(i)]

Some discussion around Total Address Count which is 55,210 address points. Vodafone think there are actually only 10,000 actual homes. Terralink and Linz define address points as occupied, which could mean shearers quarters and sheds for example. [s9(2)(a) – MBIE member] has checked coverage with electoral database and numbers come out virtually the same in that there are actually 55,000 homes roughly.

ACTION: [s9(2)(a) – MBIE member] will double check and clarify numbers of homes.

[s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] read out names of 36 sites not listed in pack that will be turned on by Christmas. Due to wet winter, there were access issues on some sites, but now ahead of the game and on schedule.

There was some discussion around Vodafone's Community Cell Cite Scheme. The 'white space debate', and in particular whether the 16% of rural households are actually aware that they won't get coverage under the RBI programme. [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] commented that communities need to know that what technologies they 'find on the internet' aren't necessarily something that can happen here.

[s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] commented that in 2-3 years there may be some new technology which could provide solutions or options for the pockets of areas that have issues.

[s9(2)(a) – Ministry of Education member] commented that local schools are keen to act as hubs for their community, like a service provider.

[s9(2)(a) – Ngā Pū Waea member] commented that Nga Pu Waea have been working on Whanganui River area where coverage is scarce. They engaged Jonathon Brewer to do an exercise which took about three months to look at the whole area and put some options forward in terms of what else they need to make connectivity work. This is with a view that if they can make it work in Whanganui, it will work elsewhere with other technologies coming in to play. They are happy with what Jonathon had come back with and the amount of consultation he went through with different providers and options. Nga Pu Waea need to go through the report and will want to publish results. The study was funded by Nga Pu Waea to get heads around issue that they might face with a lot of Maori farms in rural New Zealand, as well as the general population in those remote rural areas.

[s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] commented that Vodafone have encouraged the Wi-Fi operators who can build infrastructure leaving the last RBI tower which they could use as a point of backhaul, then can use Wi-Fi to go up valley with very low cost structures ducking around corners in point to point poles without any RMA issues associated with towers. No providers have approached Vodafone and they have been active with them. Vodafone have a very low cost price on the shared infrastructure, so the running costs for year would be a minimum. Have promoted it with price list which separates pricing for cell phone customers against Wi-Fi company with smaller kit 50% of the price. [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] mentioned some starting to see the opportunity and are making enquiries about when they see where the rural footprint is going, making enquiries about being a wholesaler. It may be a timing issue. However Vodafone accept that in the meantime they are becoming a competitor, although they wholesale services. Feeling is now that they can see opportunities. Until a tower is up we can't be sure who we reach and this might be taken into consideration. Chorus noted that some of the same people come to Chorus when they know the tower is going up, they want to talk to us about the fibre backhaul before they talk to Vodafone about the tower. They are looking at all their options.

[s9(2)(a) – Ngā Pū Waea member] commented that it's not a competition; it's about how we get the solutions working with the infrastructure where it is. How we get it the last mile to get it working in these communities. [s9(2)(a) – MBIE member] commented that a change of mindset is needed from smaller providers.

Vodafone are hoping to launch a 20GB plan, currently going through the process. They are only a few months away from launching 21mbs router so all of the service provide will come out quite quickly, consistent experience. Feedback from rural community is that in town much bigger bundles available. Important to note that running a wireless network is very different to running a fixed, so if

everyone wants to use 40mb there will be network management issues. Vodafone confident that as they learn with experience they can increase the size. [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] noted that the 16% are becoming aware that they may be part of the white space and that there are all these possibilities on the horizon. Is this just another debate Vodafone? Yes it is, [s9(2)(a) – Vodafone member] says, but hopes that [s9(2)(a) – Ngā Pū Waea member] consultant is doing something that we hope will be a model for other areas. That is that the regional Wi-Fi companies could take over the white space with low cost service. Vodafone think they may have a mobile voice and text solution that can hang off it.

White Space discussion is bigger and beyond Vodafone, so other parties need to be involved and pick it up. We have a job to do and they need to focus on getting it done, and when it's done will look at white space.

[WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(g)(i)]

CHORUS UPDATE

- Year 1 generally delivered on time [WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(b)(ii)]
- Have signed RBA2, which actually an amendment to the original agreement.
- [WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(ba)(i)]
- Amendment to pack, now working towards 1,035 schools in the programme (was 1,030). This figure does tend to move around a bit as Chorus gets to each school, they find some already have fibre.
- [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] was asked for clarification around what 'ready for service' is for the [WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(b)(ii)] schools. It means fibre has been dropped into the school, that is in to wherever the school has identified the point should be, and we have released that school onto a list that RSPs can order a service against.
- [s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] commented last year we had the problem of it being ahead of time, is that the problem where no ISPs that were willing to pick it up? [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] confirmed it was but there are now 8 ISPs as listed in the pack who are either offering services or trialling. Chorus is working with all of them to ensure delivery of service. [s9(2)(a) – MBIE member] noted that there is more than just one provider in many rural regions, as there were in the early days. There is now contestability and some really sharp pricing coming through.
- Chorus is offering each RSP five free connections and no monthly fees for schools until end June 2013. It also gives RSPs a free handover for a year. The other thing Chorus has done with RBA2 is aligned the handover point for RBI services including the schools, to the UFB handover point in schools.

[WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(b)(ii)]

- [s9(2)(a) – Ministry of Education member] commented that feedback he'd had from RSPs is that none of them are really tooled up to deal with large numbers of schools with completed fibre drops. They are not set up to go through process of signing up contracts let alone actually provision the

services. MoE have been working with MBIE and Chorus on better communications to avoid further confusion. Some boards of trustees and principals are not actually familiar with what happens with a fibre drop and the associated timeframes. We need to be clear with communications with schools, to avoid principals and Board of Trustees writing to the Minister to complain.

- [WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(g)(i)]

ACTION: [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] to let [s9(2)(a) – MBIE member] know which two hospitals were done recently. Target was four, so need to know the additional two.

[s9(2)(a) – Ministry of Education member] asked when Chorus were making announcement around Year 2 schools deployment. [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] should be able to update soon.

[WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(j)]

[s9(2)(a) – Chorus member] commented that Chorus is open to opening up the Chorus network to give others the opportunity to provide services.

[s9(2)(a) – advisory committee member] **left the meeting at 11:3.0am**
[s9(2)(a) – MBIE member] **left the meeting at 11:35am**

MINISTRY OF EDUCATION UPDATE

[s9(2)(a) – Ministry of Education member] has spent the last ten weeks travelling to 22 different locations, and around 1,900 schools taking to school boards of trustees, teachers and principals to pick up on the infrastructure required for Network for Learning.

[s9(2)(a) – Ministry of Education member] commented:

- There is frustration around lack of RSPs providing services.
- Noted that there was more innovative pricing coming along.
- MoE are encouraging schools to pick up on offerings.
- Network for Learning is on track.
- Network for Learning board has been established.
- RFPs are now in evaluation, with contracts expected by end of financial year.
- [WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(b)(ii)]
- [WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(b)(ii)]
- There is currently a five year programme to update infrastructure in schools. Schools pay 20% of cost, government pays 80%.
- MoE runs a laptop programme where every teacher has a laptop.
- No school will be forced to join the Network.
- Network for Learning is around 12 months away

[s9(2)(a) – Ministry of Education member] was asked why schools would want Network for Learning. It will be the standard, [WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(b)(ii)]. The evaluation tools are data heavy and need fibre services, copper won't be good enough.

[WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(ba)(i)]

[WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(g)(i)]

[WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(ba)(i)]

[WITHHELD UNDER SECTION 9(2)(ba)(i) and SECTION 9(2)(j)]

ACTION: [s9(2)(a) – Ministry of Education member] to be invited to attend next meeting.

GENERAL ACTIONS

- A written update to be sent to committee pre-Christmas. [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member]
- Set a date for next meeting in March by end of year. [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member]
- Continue with Smart Meeting and audio. [s9(2)(a) – Chorus member]
- Continue email traffic for any updates. ALL

RELEASED UNDER THE
OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT