# **LETF Panel Report**



| Report Date  | 31/05/2023  |
|--------------|---|
| LETF Round   | LETF Round 9: Holiday Journey Charging  |
| Purpose      | This is the panel report on round 9 of the LETF, providing recommendations for approval and decline |
| Prepared by  | Louise Murphy, EECA Secretariat   |
| Prepared for | Richard Briggs, GM Warmer Kiwi Homes, Public Sector and Transport                                   |

#### Background

- 1. Round 9 of the Low Emission Transport Fund launched on 26 April 2023 seeking rapid deployment proposals to increase the availability of public electric vehicle chargers on key holiday journey routes throughout New Zealand in time for Christmas 2023. The round closed on 17 May 2023.
- 2. EECA identified 14 major holiday journey routes with twenty-five specific locations which are the subject of this report. These routes have been identified through analysis of New Zealand traffic flows and analysis of peak-season traffic data obtained from Waka Kotahi.
- 3. An initial funding envelope of \$3 million of new funds was available for Round 9, based on the funding available in the LETF for 2022/23.
- 4. The Panel members participating in Round 9 were: Chair, Camilla Cochrane, Richard Briggs and John Hancock. The Secretariat was Louise Murphy and technical expert was Gerard Logan.

#### Assessment

#### **Procurement Process**

- 5. The Request for Proposal (RFP) for Round 9 of the Low Emission Transport Fund (LETF) opened on 26 April 2023 and closed on 17 May 2023.
- 6. EECA received 14 eligible applications from 10 applicants, applying for 19 locations in total.
- 7. The amount of co-funding requested in the eligible applications totalled \$7.33 million. This represented total project costs of \$16.67 million, with an applicant contribution of \$9.36 million.

#### **Evaluation Process**

- 8. **Administrative review** of proposals was completed based on pre-conditions outlined in the RFP. All proposals were assessed as valid for evaluation (*see Appendix 1*).
- 9. **Panel induction** a pre-assessment session was held during the moderation meeting on 22 May 2023 to outline the Panel's tasks and provide guidance on scoring. No Panel members declared a conflict of interest with any applications.

#### 10. Moderation meetings

- a) Meeting 1. This was held on 22 May 2023 where panel members discussed each application location by location, and the panel live scored each application agreeing a final score through discussion. The Panel agreed on those applications that were to be declined funding in this round.
- b) Meeting 2. The second moderation meeting was held on 23 May 2023 where the panel completed the assessment process.

#### Criteria

- 11. **A weighted attribute** (weighted criteria) evaluation method was used to determine the successful respondent.
- 12. **Evaluation criteria** applicant responses were reviewed by panel members and evaluated separately against the following criteria and weightings:
  - a) Proposed solution (30%);
  - b) Ability to deliver (30%);
  - c) Speed of Implementation (30%); and
  - d) Value for Money (10%); and
- 13. **Scoring** a scoring scale was used to evaluate proposals. Proposals were assessed and scored collectively between panel members, and the weighted average scores combined to create the final results.

#### Recommended applications

- 14. **Recommended applications** the panel was asked to rank and recommend applications based on merit, arriving at an agreed demarcation between those recommended and those declined. A final recommendation of approximately \$4.28 million was agreed, based on a clear delineation on scores and choosing one applicant chosen per location. On that basis, the panel recommends:
  - a) **19 projects** for co-funding that would allocate **\$4,277,450** (43.8% of total project costs) from Round 9, as listed in Table 1. Total project costs for the recommended applications are \$9,757,300.
- 15. The final moderated scores of all eligible applications are listed in Appendix 1.

### 16. The recommended applications have been consolidated by applicant in the following table:

| Applicant                  | Specifications   | Total<br>contract<br>value |  |  |  |
|----------------------------|--|----------------------------|--|--|--|
| Z Energy                   | Culverden – one 150kW charger with two ports (1 CHADEMO, 3 CCS)  Taipa – one 180kW + one 50kW chargers with 3 ports (1 CHADEMO, 2 CCS) |                            |  |  |  |
|                            | Wairoa – one 75kW charger with 2 ports (1 CHADEMO, 1 CCS)  | \$1,251,347                |  |  |  |
|                            | Ngatea – four 200kW chargers with 8 ports (1 CHADEMO, 7 CCS)   |                            |  |  |  |
|                            | Stratford - two 180kW chargers with 4 ports (1 CHADEMO, 3 CCS)   |                            |  |  |  |
| The Lines<br>Company       | Taumarunui - one 150kW charger with two ports (2 CCS)  | \$122,500                  |  |  |  |
| WEL                        | Hikuai – two 160kW chargers with four ports (1 CHADEMO, 3 CCS)   | \$521,500                  |  |  |  |
| Networks                   | Raglan – two 180kW chargers with four ports (1 CHADEMO, 3 CCS)   | \$321,300                  |  |  |  |
| ChargeNet                  | Greytown - two 150kW chargers with 4 ports (1 CHADEMO, 3 CCS)  |                            |  |  |  |
|                            | Paeroa - two 150kW chargers with 4 ports (1 CHADEMO, 3 CCS)  |                            |  |  |  |
|                            | Whakatāne - two 15 kW chargers with 4 ports (1 CHADEMO, 3 CCS)   | \$570,000                  |  |  |  |
| 9(2)(b)(ii)                | Greytown, Paeroa & Whakatane were recommended by the panel   |                            |  |  |  |
|                            |  |                            |  |  |  |
|                            | (Withdrawn)  |                            |  |  |  |
| Jump                       | Geraldine - two 150kW chargers with four ports (1 CHADEMO, 3 CCS)  |                            |  |  |  |
| Charging                   | Twizel - two 150kW chargers with four ports (1 CHADEMO, 3 CCS)   | \$876,500                  |  |  |  |
|                            | Omarama – two 150kW chargers with four ports (1 CHADEMO, 3 CCS)  |                            |  |  |  |
| EV                         | Roxburgh - one 150kW charger with two ports (1 CHADEMO, 1 CCS)   |                            |  |  |  |
| Infrastructure<br>Partners | Te Anau - one 150kW charger with two ports (1 CHADEMO, 1 CCS)  | \$838,150                  |  |  |  |
|                            | Greymouth - two 150kW chargers with four ports (1 CHADEMO, 3 CCS)  | \$050,150                  |  |  |  |
|                            | Mangawhai - two 150kW chargers with four ports (1 CHADEMO, 3 CCS)  |                            |  |  |  |

9(2)(b)(ii)

17. **Due diligence** - the panel does not consider it necessary to undertake pre-contract due diligence on any of the recommended applicants as it believes the additional enquiries made by the secretariat during the moderation process are sufficient.

#### 18. Funding thresholds

- a) No recommended projects are above \$500,000 funding threshold.
- b) No projects have been recommended above 50% of co-funding.

#### 19. Reduced funding

No recommended projects were reduced funding.

20. **Applications declined** - appendix 2 lists all applications the Panel recommends be declined for co-funding in this round.



Table 1: Panel recommendation to the EECA Approver (listed in location / route order)

| Numbe<br>r | Applicant                                    | Application<br>location | Theme           | Total Project costs 9(2)(b)(ii) | Requested co-funding | Co-funding recommende d | Contract<br>condition<br>s | Project descriptions  [9(2)(b)(ii)                                    |
|------------|--|-------------------------|-----------------|---------------------------------|----------------------|-------------------------|----------------------------|---|
| 09-184     | Jump<br>Charging                             | Geraldine               | Holiday Journey | 9(2)(D)(II)                     |                      | \$272,500               | N/A                        | Jump Charging are installing 2 x 150kW chargers Geraldine.            |
| 09-184     | Jump<br>Charging                             | Twizel                  | Holiday Journey |                                 |                      | \$308,500               | N/A                        | Jump Charging are installing 2 x 150kW chargers  Twizel.              |
| 09-184     | Jump<br>Charging                             | Omarama                 | Holiday Journey |                                 |                      | \$295,500               | N/A                        | Jump Charging are installing 2 x 150kW chargers Omarama.              |
| 09-193     | Z Energy                                     | Culverden               | Holiday Journey |                                 |                      | \$240,000               | N/A                        | Z Energy are installing 1 x 150kW charger Culverden.                  |
| 09-190     | EV<br>Infrastructur<br>e Partners<br>Limited | Roxburgh                | Holiday Journey |                                 |                      | \$165,100               | N/A                        | EV Infrastructure Partners are installing 1 x 150kW charger Roxburgh. |

| 09-185 | ChargeNet       | Greytown  | Holiday Journey |  | \$190,000 | N/A | ChargeNet are installing 2 x 150kW chargers  Greytown.        |
|--------|-----------------|-----------|-----------------|--|-----------|-----|---|
| 09-185 | ChargeNet       | Paeroa    | Holiday Journey |  | \$190,000 | N/A | ChargeNet are installing 2 x 150kW chargers  Paeroa.          |
| 09-187 | WEL<br>Networks | Hikuai    | Holiday Journey |  | \$266,000 | N/A | WEL Networks are installing 2 x 160kW chargers Hikuai.        |
| 09-185 | ChargeNet       | Whakatane | Holiday Journey |  | \$190,000 | N/A | ChargeNet are installing 2 x 150kW chargers at Whakatāne.     |
| 09-192 | Z Energy        | Taipa     | Holiday Journey |  | \$283,800 | N/A | Z Energy are installing 1 x 180kW and 1 x 50kW charger Taipa. |
| 09-192 | Z Energy        | Wairoa    | Holiday Journey |  | \$150,000 | N/A | Z Energy are installing 1 x 75kW charger Wairoa.              |

INTERNAL MEMO | 31/05/2023 6

| 09-187 | WEL<br>Networks                              | Raglan     | Holiday Journey |  | \$255,500 | N/A | WEL Networks are installing 2 x 180kW chargers , Raglan.                 |
|--------|--|------------|-----------------|--|-----------|-----|--|
| 09-190 | EV<br>Infrastructur<br>e Partners<br>Limited | Te Anau    | Holiday Journey |  | \$165,100 | N/A | EV Infrastructure Partners are installing 1 x 150kW charger , Te Anau.   |
| 09-192 | Z Energy                                     | Ngatea     | Holiday Journey |  | \$327,500 | N/A | Z Energy are installing 1 x 75kW charger, Ngatea.                        |
| 09-190 | EV<br>Infrastructur<br>e Partners<br>Limited | Greymouth  | Holiday Journey |  | \$240,850 | N/A | EV Infrastructure Partners are installing 2 x 150kW chargers  Greymouth. |
| 09-190 | EV<br>Infrastructur<br>e Partners<br>Limited | Mangawhai  | Holiday Journey |  | \$267,100 | N/A | EV Infrastructure Partners are installing 2 x 150kW chargers Greymouth.  |
| 09-188 | The Lines<br>Company                         | Taumarunui | Holiday Journey |  | \$122,500 | N/A | The Lines Company are installing 1 x 150kW charger Taumarunui.           |

INTERNAL MEMO | 31/05/2023 7

#### TE TARI TIAKI PŪNGAO - ENERGY EFFICIENCY AND CONSERVATION AUTHORITY

| 09-192                | Z Energy | Stratford | Holiday Journey |  | \$247,500 | N/A | Z Energy are installing 2 x 180kW chargers , Stratford. |
|-----------------------|----------|-----------|-----------------|--|-----------|-----|---|
| 09-191<br>9(2)(b)(ii) |          |           |                 |  |           | N/A |   |

INTERNAL MEMO | 31/05/2023 8

# **LETF Panel Report**



#### Recommendations

- 21. It is recommended that the **Approver:** 
  - a. **Note** that this report presents the collective view of the members of the LETF assessment panel for Round 9;
  - b. **Approve** for Round 9 of the Low Emission Transport Fund EECA funds up to the recommended amounts for the projects identified in Table 1 above for total cofunding of \$4,277,450.
  - c. **Agree** that funding be subject to applicants meeting various conditions, as noted in Table 1 above;
  - d. **Agree** that the applications listed in Appendix 2 be declined.

Richard Briggs

GM Warmer Kiwi Homes, Public Sector and Transport

### 9(2)(b)(ii)

## **Appendices**

\*Copy/paste typo made and declared by original author. Column titles should read: "Proposed Solution, Ability to Deliver, Speed of Implementation, Value for Money".

Appendix 1: Moderated final average scores for all eligible applications in order of

their location / route number.

|           |  |                      | *                      | 7                  |                 |                    |                      |                          |
|-----------|--|----------------------|------------------------|--------------------|-----------------|--------------------|----------------------|--------------------------|
| Location  | Applicant                                | Fit w/<br>Investment | Fit with<br>Investment | Ability to deliver | Value for Money | Combined<br>scores | Moderated co-funding | Decision                 |
| Geraldine | Jump Charging                            | 3                    | 2.1                    | 3                  | 1               | 9.1                | \$272,500            | Recommended for approval |
|           |  |                      |                        |                    |                 |                    |                      |                          |
|           |  |                      |                        |                    |                 |                    |                      |                          |
|           |  |                      |                        |                    |                 |                    |                      |                          |
| Twizel    | Jump Charging                            | 3                    | 2.1                    | 2.1                | 0.6             | 7.8                | \$308,500            | Recommended for approval |
|           |  |                      |                        |                    |                 |                    |                      |                          |
| Omarama   | Jump Charging                            | 3                    | 2.1                    | 2.1                | 0.8             | 8                  | \$295,500            | Recommended for approval |
| Culverden | Z Energy                                 | 3                    | 2.7                    | 1.8                | 0.9             | 8.4                | \$240,000            | Recommended for approval |
| Roxburgh  | EV<br>Infrastructure<br>Partners Limited | 2.7                  | 2.4                    | 2.1                | 0.6             | 7.8                | \$165,100            | Recommended for approval |
|           | ÷  |                      |                        |                    |                 | -                  | •                    |                          |
| Greytown  | ChargeNet                                | 3                    | 2.7                    | 2.4                | 0.8             | 8.9                | \$190,000            | Recommended for approval |
| Paeroa    | ChargeNet                                | 2.1                  | 2.7                    | 2.4                | 0.8             | 8                  | \$190,000            | Recommended for approval |
|           |  |                      |                        |                    |                 |                    |                      |                          |
| _         | ÷  |                      | -                      |                    |                 | -                  | •                    |                          |

| Hikuai     | WEL Networks                             | 3   | 2.4 | 2.1 | 0.9 | 8.4 | \$266,000      | Recommended for approval |
|------------|--|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|----------------|--------------------------|
| Whakatane  | ChargeNet                                | 3   | 2.7 | 2.4 | 0.9 | 9   | \$190,000      | Recommended for approval |
|            |  |     |     |     |     |     | •              |                          |
|            |  |     |     |     |     |     |                |                          |
|            |  |     |     |     | _   | -   | •              |                          |
| Taipa      | Z Energy                                 | 3   | 2.7 | 1.8 | 0.7 | 8.2 | \$283,800      | Recommended for approval |
| Wairoa     | Z Energy                                 | 3   | 2.7 | 1.8 | 0.9 | 8.4 | \$150,000      | Recommended for approval |
| Raglan     | WEL Networks                             | 2.4 | 2.4 | 2.1 | 0.7 | 7.6 | \$255,500      | Recommended for approval |
| Te Anau    | EV<br>Infrastructure<br>Partners Limited | 2.7 | 2.4 | 2.1 | 0.7 | 7.9 | \$165,100      | Recommended for approval |
|            |  |     |     |     |     |     |                |                          |
| Ngatea     | Z Energy                                 | 3   | 2.7 | 2.4 | 0.9 | 9   | \$327,500      | Recommended for approval |
| Greymouth  | EV<br>Infrastructure<br>Partners Limited | 2.7 | 2.4 | 2.1 | 0.7 | 7.9 | \$240,850      | Recommended for approval |
|            |  |     |     |     |     | I   |                |                          |
|            |  |     |     |     |     |     | •              |                          |
| Mangawhai  | EV<br>Infrastructure<br>Partners Limited | 3   | 2.4 | 1.8 | 0.9 | 8.1 | \$267,100      | Recommended for approval |
| Taumarunui | The Lines<br>Company                     | 3   | 2.1 | 2.4 | 1   | 8.5 | \$12 ,50agree0 | Recommended for approval |
|            |  |     |     |     |     | •   | •              |                          |

| Stratford | Z Energy | 3 | 2.7 | 2.4 | 0.9 | 9 | \$247,500 | Recommended for approval |
|-----------|----------|---|-----|-----|-----|---|-----------|--------------------------|
|           |          |   |     |     |     |   |           |                          |
|           |          |   |     |     |     |   |           |                          |
|           |          |   |     |     |     |   |           |                          |

Appendix 2: Applications to be declined. 9(2)(b)(ii)

| Location | Applicant | Decision                  | Basis for recommendation |
|----------|-----------|---------------------------|--------------------------|
|          |           |                           |                          |
|          |           | Recommended to decline    |                          |
| _        |           | Recommended<br>to decline |                          |
|          |           | Recommended to decline    |                          |
|          |           | Recommended<br>to decline |                          |
|          |           | Recommended<br>to decline |                          |
|          |           | Recommended<br>to decline |                          |
|          |           | Recommended<br>to decline |                          |
|          |           | Recommended<br>to decline |                          |
|          |           | Recommended to decline    |                          |

|  | Recommended<br>to decline |  |
|--|---------------------------|--|
|  | Recommended to decline    |  |
|  | Recommended<br>to decline |  |
|  | Recommended<br>to decline |  |
|  | Recommended<br>to decline |  |
|  | Recommended<br>to decline |  |