

## 2018 Census External Data Quality Panel: Minutes of Meeting on 14 February 2019

Date and time	14 February 2019, 9am to 3:30pm
Location	Stats NZ, Wellington Office 8 Gilmer Terrace Wellington
Present - panel members	Richard Bedford - Chair Tahu Kukutai Donna Cormack Alison Reid Thomas Lumley Len Cook Barry Milne Ian Cope
Present – Stats NZ	Kathy Connolly, General Manager Census Vince Galvin, Chief Methodologist Gareth Meech, Senior Manager Census and Secretariat Steph Prosser, Senior Analyst Census Adele Quinn, Manager Census Analytics Christine Bycroft, Principal Statistician
Meeting minutes	<p><b>9-10am – Review previous minutes and action points</b></p> <p>The Chair and secretariat worked through the action points from the December meeting. Specific updates are noted in the second half of this document.</p> <p>The Chair also noted that panel members are not able to give good advice if they are not given time to review the materials prior. The slide pack for this meeting was only finalised by Stats NZ in the morning of the meeting. This cannot happen for future meetings.</p> <p><b><u>Feedback from combined external reviewers and data panel meeting 13 February</u></b></p> <p>With Richard being less available after April, Liz has agreed to appoint a co-chair to the panel. Alison Reid has agreed to do this and will work closely with Richard. This needs to be formalised. Ian will be in NZ until after the March meeting.</p> <p>Panel will start preparing a report which focusses on methods used to improve census coverage that will be given to Liz at the end of April, or beginning of May. The panel will require more written information on methods and has started preparing documents addressing relevant issues including legal and privacy.</p> <p>The panel suggested that Stats NZ needs to make a distinction between what will be official census counts and what data will be provided in other ways. Equity of access as a result of uneven responses is a concern as some groups will have good data while for others the data quality will be much more variable. Data quality will be more variable than in the past.</p> <p>A question was raised about the key users of census and whether they will receive quality data.</p>

The panel noted there will be method papers needed to help them produce the report(s). Carol discussed the possibility of producing provisional counts before our official first release. The panel responded noting that the data is not just late but that it won't have everything present and that we should say what kind of quality measures we will be producing to support use. There will likely be a number of technical caveats.

The panel also suggested that if we release some provisional but not other data there could be equity concerns. We need to flag if we can't release data as soon as possible. Stats NZ noted that this may be more around which products contain data rather than not being prepared to provide data in other ways.

The panel's final report is being planned for delivery in September 2019.

**AP5-1:** Need to clarify admin enumeration, admin imputation and other terminology. Stats NZ to review short paper by Thomas on definitions produced by a panel member.

**AP5-2:** Provide list of proposed external method documents to support communication including 'What is a response?'

The panel also made the point that the Government Statistician has a duty of care to make sure the data is trustworthy – that this is not market research findings. Stats NZ noted that we need to take a 'top-down' view of the situation.

#### **Data and methods update**

Stats NZ presented slides updating basic counts and Māori ethnic data and then moved onto the recent decision made about methods. A comment was made about the Māori ethnic data presented that Stats NZ will need to be able to show evidence to justify adding different categories of data together (eg. 2018 survey responses + 2013 Census data + admin data) and how this improves the quality and usefulness of the dataset.

The panel noted that with the methods being presented that we may end up with higher and lower quality data sets.

During the presentation the panel asked to see more detailed papers that support the decisions being made.

**AP5-3:** Gareth to make internal papers that have been sent to the internal Technical Advisory Group available to the panel including the occupancy misclassification paper and PES methodology change papers.

During the discussion about the preferred method and decision to progress with 'Individual focused approach' that panel noted:

- The method doesn't impute households particularly for NZ Dep
- The original plan B ran the risk of 'messing up' household data. The enhanced 'individual focused method may address some of these issues
- Stats NZ will need to be able to explain why this option was chosen
- That the impact of these changes may lead to the 2018 dataset being more suitable for producing 'level or prevalence' data rather than measuring intercensal changes (with impacts of time series comparability)
- Most users would want us to prioritise change of absolute level

The panel noted that the rapid change in approach means that the panel is catching up if we only meet monthly. Is there a way to keep the panel better informed more frequently?

**AP5-4:** Stats NZ to propose additional contact channels with the panel to aid engagement during rapid changes to methods.

#### Non-private dwellings

During the presentation section showing the approach to admin enumeration of prisons and defence establishments, the panel raised a concern that prison data is not necessarily provided voluntarily and agrees data collected on prisoners' iwi may be poor. The panel questioned the overall quality of the prison data.

**AP5-3:** Internal paper explaining approach to prison and defence admin enumeration to be circulated to the panel.

#### Māori descent imputation discussion

Stats explained that the intended approach to Māori descent imputation for 2018 was to not impute for non-response. But given the higher non-response and that ethnicity is being imputed this needs to be checked. The panel also noted:

- That from longitudinal research produced, an individual's Māori descent appears to be more stable than ethnicity
- Advice to preserve the relativity of Māori descent and ethnicity
- This will need good documentation about what was done and why.

**AP5-4:** Tahu and Donna to link previous research and papers they already have and provide any further feedback to Stats NZ.

#### Census engagement

Kathy presented on the overall 'fit for purpose' approach, engagement progress and next steps. The panel noted:

- Combining 2018 Census and Next Census engagement may create issues as the focus needs to be on 2018.
- Talking to the Iwi Data Leaders Forum on 22 Feb is a good opportunity to engage but we will need to engage with many others who are not there very quickly
- The proposed timetable to engage with a wide range of Māori and iwi stakeholders will be hard to resource and complete in time – Stats NZ will be scrambling with the timetable
- Iwi and Māori are investing time and money into getting ready to use 2018 Census data so the earlier Stats let them know what might be published (or not published) the better
- Current Census webpages have information about census performance that is out of date and may now be misleading".
- Building internal Māori capability is important.
- Stats NZ should consider a risk assessment for Māori and iwi use.

Gareth presented an update on the fit for purpose engagement findings and resources. The panel had some questions about the data use spreadsheet that had recently been uploaded to sharepoint. There was interest in the sensitivity analysis work started. The possible addition of approaching Ngai Tahu to complete some sensitivity work was not supported given equity of access and political considerations.

#### Programme performance indicator progress

The panel ran out of time to hear this presentation. A request was made to see the original 2018 Census business case and the cost-benefit analysis commissioned in 2013.

**AP5-5:** Load the 2018 Census business case and the cost-benefit analysis commissioned in 2013 to the shared space.

This item will be rolled over to a later meeting.

Meeting summary discussion

- Panelists are struggling with no or little reading time to prepare for meetings. Stats NZ is only getting a 'reaction' rather than considered advice.
- Clarification of the panels role is required as the panel is now starting to write the papers need to be clear.
- The Terms of Reference should be updated to reflect extension of panel engagement, co-chair arrangement and any concerns the chair has around the role of the panel
- Panel aiming to have initial report to Liz by end of April/beginning of May.
- The critical path explained at the combined meeting of the panel and external reviewers on 13 Feb will be uploaded to the shared space.

**AP5-6:** Stats initially to revise the terms of reference for pragmatic things like date extensions, role of other governance etc but then to panel for a deeper review by the panel. Liz and Richard will need to sign-off additional revisions.

**AP5-7:** Stats NZ to include a 'what is a response?' paper in the list of method papers to assist the panel report writing

**The next meetings dates are:**

- in-committee only 27 February, Auckland
- 6 March, Auckland
- 12 April, in Auckland
- May and later dates to be confirmed.

**Action log**

Ref	Date raised	Description	Owner	Date required	Progress	Status
<b>Meeting 2 actions</b>						
AP 2-0	23/10/18	Revise minutes from the first meeting and present to for confirmation at the meeting on 9 November.	Richard and Gareth	By 9 Nov	9/11 To be completed by 23 Nov. 18/2 v1.1 uploaded to sharepoint	Close
AP 2-2	23/10/18	Create and distribute a conflict of interest register	Gareth	By 9 Nov	9/11 To be completed and added to Sharepoint before Dec meeting. 6/12 Added to Sharepoint/Shared Documents – 7/12 Leave action open for panel members to fill in prior to 14 Feb 2019 meeting 18/2 Close but note that the most panel members	Close

					have not added anything to the conflict document	
AP 2-4	23/10/18	More information requested about what investigations we are doing into 2013 counts and response rates – are we assuming that 2013 is correct?	Panel	By Dec meeting	9/11 Information presented that include 2013 response rates and counts. Gareth to check with Richard whether this should be closed by 23 Nov. 6/12 Gareth to discuss with Richard 18/2 Stats may need a specific 2013 methods paper to document any inconsistencies in approach and will be captured in methodology papers and metadata documentation. Gareth to upload proposed method papers (completed 18 Feb). Panel to review paper and offer comments by 6 March.	Open
AP 2-6	23/10/18	Need more detail about the totality and components of the imputation methods initially planned and now being implemented.	Gareth	By 9 Nov	Sessions at 30 Oct meeting and priority at full 9 Nov meeting. 9/11 Information presented at meeting. Gareth to check with Richard whether this should be closed by 23 Nov. 6/12 Gareth to discuss with Richard 18/2 Spreadsheet detailing variables and imputation processes to be sent to panel prior to 6 March meeting.	Open
AP 2-10	23/10/18	Request for data on birthplace.	Christine	By Dec meeting	Topic for December meeting 9/11 To be presented at Dec meeting. 7/12 Data added to workspace by 7 Dec 18/2 Richard to discuss further with Christine 6/3 Wanting pop insights set of data showing net gains and losses by birthplace over intercensal period Mar 2013 to Dec 2017. Not on workplan, but planning further work on using admin data more effectively. Country of birth on list.	Close
AP 2-13	23/10/18	More information needed about IDI household matching including whether there will be any more specific targeting of areas with the threshold cut-offs (have we	Christine	By 9 Nov	9/11 Presentation on mitigation including imputations completed at Nov meeting. Gareth to talk with Richard about whether this should stay open.	Close

		considered using different cut-off rules for different parts of the population?).			6/12 Gareth to discuss with Richard 18/2 Close, – covered by AP2-6	
AP 2-16	23/10/18	Re electoral implications, more information is required about the representativeness of the data and impacts of imputations. A range of scenarios, including constitutional impacts for Māori, would be useful	Kathy and Gareth	By 9 Nov	Discussion planned for 9 Nov meeting. 9/11 No additional electoral data was presented (as not complete yet). Updated draft electoral calculations to be presented to panel in Dec meeting. 6/12 Electoral data has not yet been run – targeting Feb meeting update. 18/2 Updated electoral data to be presented to 6 March meeting dot loves data note	Open
<b>Meeting 3 actions</b>						
AP 3-4	9/11/18	Correct minutes from 23 Oct meeting adding a note to the sentence ‘that we could test the model accuracy’ in addition to collecting more data from respondents.	Gareth	By 23 Nov	6/12 added, new version to be uploaded after Dec meeting. 18/2 Completed, , updated v0.9 to be added to sharepoint, close	Close
AP 3-5	9/11/18	More information about what admin data is used in the method and for what purpose. Privacy Impact Assessment update. Add to agenda for December.	Gareth	By 7 Dec	6/12 Did not have time for this item in the Dec agenda. Will present information in Feb. 14/2 Requested list for all variables about what commitments we have made for use of admin data in the past and now. Rolled into AP2-6.	Open
AP 3-6	9/11/18	Check the table stating the percentage of the IDI_ERP using different admin sources as data does not look right.	Christine	By 7 Dec	To be completed 14/2 Christine checked as it did not look right. Data is correct but need it documented in time for first report. Close.	Close
AP 3-7	9/11/18	More information needed about the sources and component of admin data used to help fill gaps in Māori descent data.	Christine	23 Nov	6/12 included in Dec presentation 14/2 To be rolled up into AP2-6. Presented in December and also close as duplicate	Close
AP 3-9	9/11/18	More information needed about the sub-types of Non-Private Dwellings (NPDs). Check when this detail will be available for the panel and add to sharepoint folder when ready.	Gareth	By 21 Dec	6/12 Info not yet available, can target Feb or Mar meeting 14/2 Presented at Feb meeting. Close	Close
AP 3-10	9/11/18	Clarification is needed about what data is used in the census administration enumeration (referred to	Panel members	By 7 Dec	6/12 Leave open, not addressed yet 14/2 PIA includes detail, but hard to follow. Suggest	Open

		as IDI data in the presentation), and a list of the current variables being imputed, where it comes from, whether the data suppliers are aware of its use and whether it uses identifiable or de-identified person data.			adding a flowchart to aid communication. Panel to review the PIA and give feedback. 6/3 Any comments to get back to stats ASAP	
AP 3-11	9/11/18	Present criteria about the thresholds being used to make decisions about methods.	Gareth and Christine	By 7 Dec	6/12 Some information in Dec meeting present, more info to come after meeting. Leave open. 14/2 Panel will be using Canadian quality framework. Request more information about quality plans at March meeting. 6/3 Some information at 6 March meeting. Confirm whether	Open
AP3-12		Panel members to think further about going back into the field and whether they had any further advice for us (as they didn't think they had time to appropriately digest and respond at the meeting).	Kathy	By 7 Dec	6/12 Check with panel about whether there was any more feedback. 14/12 Panel unable to comment on this yet with only a brief discussion in November. The panel needs more information from Stats NZ on what sorts of options exist for collecting further data from the field. Kathy to report back to February or March 2019 meeting. 14/2 Stats is not going back into the field, this needs to be documented internally. Close	Close
AP 3-14	30/10/18	The Dwelling Frame evaluation report to be shared with the q/a panel	Adele	14 Feb 2019	14/2 To be uploaded to shared space by 6 March. 6/3 Uploaded to workspace	close
AP 3-15	30/10/18	Provide information on births and removals from the Dwelling frame during the live operation	Adele/Chris H	14 Feb 2019	14/2 Some information was presented to the panel in November. More to be loaded to workspace before March meeting 6/3 Uploaded to workspace	close
AP 3-16	30/10/18	Produce an estimate of population at small geographies by applying the average household size from 2013 census to the number of dwellings on the dwelling frame.	Adele	14 Feb 2019	14/2 This was investigated and did not improve the situation. Only changed count by very marginal amount. Close	Close
AP 3-17	30/10/18	Produce a matrix showing the counts of people listed on the dwelling questionnaire against the number of individual questionnaires	Adele	14 Feb 2019	14/2 Provided. Close	Close

AP 3-18	30/10/18	Confirm the source of local estimates of those born overseas (e.g. in Auckland)	Gareth	14 Feb 2019	14/2 Was investigated but didn't provide specific help. Close	Close
AP 3-19	30/10/18	Provide the panel with information on staff shortages at local levels of geography – ideally in a way that identifies the impact on workloads	Gareth	14 Feb 2019	13/12 Gareth: Suggest this is out of scope but in scope of the external review and to close action 14/2 Out of scope to external data quality panel. Close	Close
AP 3-20	30/10/18	Report back on how might the problems with the scanning field staff recruitment vendors impact on response rates?	Gareth	14 Feb 2019	13/12 Gareth: Suggest this is out of scope but in scope of the external review and to close action 14/2 Out of scope to external data quality panel. Close	Close
AP 3-21	30/10/18	Share paper with the panel on the imputation approach and the CPT recommendations on which admin variables to use for imputation. Ideally also to include a flow chart of the process.	Gareth	14 Feb 2019	14/2 Duplicated action point. Close this but keep AP2-6 open. Close	Close
AP 3-22	30/10/18	Elaboration of the options around imputation – with the pros and cons of each option and the impacts on users spelt out (maybe in a table with a Red/Amber/Green status?)	Christine	14 Feb 2019	14/2 Update given at 14 Feb meeting. Close	Close
<b>Meeting 4 actions</b>						
AP 4-1	7/12/18	Ensure all panel members have shared workspace write-access and items are labelled appropriately.	Gareth	By 21 Dec	13/12 Panel members now given write access. Documents to be renamed by 21 Dec 14/2 Completed, close	Close
AP 4-2	7/12/18	Secretariat to ensure all documents have useful headers and footers so once open it is clear what panel members are reviewing.	Gareth	By 21 Dec	13/12 Noted for future attachments. All current docs to be updated by Xmas 14/2 Completed, close	Close
AP 4-3	7/12/18	Create and load document with Internet Collection System screen shots for panel members.	Adele	By 14 Feb meeting	18/12 Two documents (AP4-3a and AP4-3b) uploaded to workspace with screenshots. Will leave open until Feb meeting for panel let know whether there is enough information. 14/2 No more information available for panel. Close	Close
AP 4-5	7/12/18	Document how multiple de-identified data points in admin sources have been protected from identification once they are assembled.	Christine	By 14 Feb meeting	14/2 Assign to methods team. Confirm priority with Richard. 6/3 Panel to look at methods paper	Open



AP 4-6	7/12/18	Document 'What is the legal basis that it is OK to do what we are doing with admin data and what are the ethical implications we have considered?' 'What commitment has Stats NZ given to respondents and data suppliers about what we are doing with admin data? What have they said? What are the key data sources?'	Carol	By 14 Feb meeting	14/2 Although Liz discussed the issues with the panel at meeting on 5 Feb, panel still wants a statement from Stats about the legal basis of admin sources. Without, it is a risk for the panel to endorse. High ethical standard set by the Stats NZ at the 2017 data summit. Done	Open
AP 4-7	7/12/18	Share draft list of technical reports with the panel to see if this list will also help the panel produce the independent report. The panel has also created a list of documents that would be helpful, so these can be compared.	Gareth	By 14 Feb meeting	14/2 Draft paper describing planned papers added to sharepoint on 18 Feb. Duplicate from previous meeting. Close	Close
AP 4-8	7/12/18	Consult over when Stats NZ will return to the panel with a decision about public release of iwi data	Richard and Gareth	By 14 Feb meeting	14/2 Stats to cover in meeting on 14 Feb. Check with Richard if enough information to close. 6/3 iwi data leaders key messages sent to panel. Decision made Stats will not talk publically about data quality until April announcement. Need to have conversation with iwi before Leave open nuntil decision about April iwi announcement is confirmed. Panel is writing up document to be sent to stats about panel view about quality of iwi data. Keep open	Open
AP 4-9	7/12/18	Update panel once more detail has been completed on the quality framework including an ordering of decision making criteria.	Gareth	By 14 Feb meeting	14/2 Planned item on 6 March agenda. 6/3 To be reviewed after 6 Mar presentation	Open
AP 4-10	7/12/18	Upload the full customer engagement spreadsheets to the workspace.	Gareth	By 21 Dec	14/2 Completed on 12/2. Close	Close
AP 4-11	7/12/18	Discuss with Len after the Dec meeting whether the document 'Information census legislative obligations – DRAFT 5 Dec 2018' loaded into the workspace goes into sufficient detail about Stats NZ legal obligations.	Kathy and Len	By 21 Dec	14/2 Close duplicate of (still open) AP 4-6	Close

AP 4-12	7/12/18	Create a table to summarise variable data sources, concepts and hierarchy.	Adele	By 14 Feb meeting	14/2 Duplicate of AP2-6. Close	Close
AP 4-13	7/12/18	Create a table to summarise variable quality measures.	Gareth	By 14 Feb meeting	14/2 Did not have time to present, planned for 6 March meeting. 2/6 Added to workspace	close
AP 4-14	7/12/18	Facilitate set-up of an in-committee meeting (without Stats people in attendance) in late Jan or Feb 2019.	Gareth and Sophie	By 21 Dec	13/12 Room in Wellington Stats office and travel booked for Auckland people coming. Food and room access remaining actions. 14/2 5 Feb set up. Close	Close
AP 4-17	7/12/18	Check panel members availability for April meeting.	Gareth	By 21 Dec	14/2 Meeting is booked to 12 April in Auckland, but will check with panel members via email on 22/2.	close
<b>Meeting 5 actions</b>						
AP 5-1	14/2/19	Need to clarify admin enumeration, admin imputation and other terminology. Thomas created a short paper of definitions to be reviewed by Stats NZ.	Adele, Christine	By 6 March	6/3 Writing a paper for panel about admin vs survey data. Kathy to send to SNZ for review.	Open
AP 5-2	14/2/19	Provide list of proposed external method documents to support communication including 'What is a response?'	Gareth	By 6 March	14/2 Duplicated with AP2-4	Close
AP 5-3	14/2/19	Load technical papers presented to internal Technical Advisory Group to the shared space including approach to prison and defence admin enumeration.	Gareth	By 6 March	6/3 several papers added, more to come. Any specific requests welcome	close
AP 5-4	14/2/19	Additional ways for information to get to the panel during the rapid changes	Gareth	By 6 March	Regular emails each week	Close
AP 5-5	14/2/19	Find and load 2018 Census business case document and valuing the census to the shared space	Gareth	By 6 March	6/3 Added to workspace	close
AP 5-6	14/2/19	Revise terms of reference (mainly around the mechanics of the panel purpose, then for the panel to review and sign-off from Liz and Richard	Gareth and panel	By 6 March	3/3 Sent to Richard for initial review	Open
AP 5-7	14/2/19	Panel members to add links to the previous research and papers on Māori descent and ethnicity they already have and provide any further feedback to Stats NZ.	Tahu and Donna	By 6 March	6/3 Link added to shared documents	close

AP5-8	14/2/19	Include s 'what is a response' paper in the list of method papers that would assist the panel to write the reports	Christine	By 10 April		Open

Released under the Official Information Act