

2018 Census External Data Quality Panel: Minutes of Meeting on 7 December 2018

Date and time	7 December 2018, 9am to 3:30pm
Location	Stats NZ, Auckland Office 48 Greys Avenue, Auckland Central
Present - panel members	Richard Bedford - Chair Tahu Kukutai Donna Cormack Alison Reid Thomas Lumley Len Cook (on video conference from Wellington from 11:30am) Barry Milne Ian Cope (on video conference from UK until 1pm)
Present – Stats NZ	<u>Auckland</u> Kathy Connolly, General Manager Census Vince Galvin, Chief Methodologist Gareth Meech, Senior Manager Census and Secretariat Steph Prosser, Senior Analyst Census Adele Quinn, Manager Census Analytics Christine Bycroft, Principal Statistician <u>Christchurch via v/c for selected sessions</u> Brooke Theyers, Senior Population Insights Robert Didham, Demographic Analyst Mike Berry, Manager Census Content and Customer Relations Digby Carter, Statistical Analyst, Census Content and Customer Relations
Meeting minutes	<p>9-10am – Previous minutes and shared workspace issues</p> <p>The Chair and secretariat worked through the minutes from the November meeting. Specific updates are noted in the second half of this document. The secretariat then talked through the new shared workspace structure and answered questions about the setup. Noted that it looked like panel members did not have write-access. Also noted that any attachments added should be appropriately labelled to allow easier reference and cross reference.</p> <p>AP4-1: Secretariat to ensure all panel members have shared workspace write-access and items are labelled appropriately.</p> <p>AP4-2: Secretariat to ensure all documents have useful headers and footers to ensure it is clear what panel members are reviewing.</p> <p>There were several comments from the panel that the late loading of the shared workspace the previous day made it difficult for the panel members to be prepared. This was acknowledged but it was pointed out that the newly run data meant many parts of the presentation had only been created during the previous 2-3 days. There was also a discussion about whether the panel members should have access to a folder just for their use. Such a folder can be created but it would not be completely secure given that the manager of the secure site (the secretariat) would</p>

have access. However, the panel was assured that Stats NZ staff would not access the material in such a folder if it was created. No specific action is required at this stage.

A glossary was also requested for SNZ acronyms.

AP4-15: Gareth to begin compiling a glossary of acronyms that can be added to over time. This will be uploaded to the workspace.

The date for the March meeting was confirmed as Wednesday 6 March 2019 in Auckland.

There was a request to add an action to load a document that shows the internet collection system screens that respondents completed – in particular the household set-up form. Adele noted that we do not have a full copy of every screen, but we could collate screen shots from most parts of the system.

AP4-3: Adele to create a load document with Internet Collection System screen shots for panel members.

10am – Update about public communications and programme timelines

Kathy talked about the media release published on 27 Nov and the low general media uptake to date. There has been some interest on social media and from Māori media. Kathy thanked the panel for their advice as it influenced the media release and supporting messages. The panel commented that stakeholders were not that surprised by the announcement. Kathy discussed some complementary strategies being started to better meet the needs for data for Māori. The panel noted that if Stats NZ know now that iwi data are not going to be of sufficient quality for publication then they should be letting key Māori stakeholders know this as soon as possible.

An updated 2018 Census Privacy Impact Assessment (PIA) has been published that updates the public about the data linking and protections being used. There was a discussion that if the PIA does not contain the full picture, Stats NZ would be under increased scrutiny and exposure to risk. There was a level of discomfort about the chain of consent from individuals through data suppliers to Stats NZ. It was also noted that a discussion at a previous meeting had not created an action point about what commitments Stats NZ has given to respondents and data suppliers (see new AP4-6).

AP4-4: Gareth to add link to PIA to shared workspace.

AP4-5: Stats to document how multiple de-identified data points have been protected from identification once they are assembled.

AP4-6: Stats NZ to document ‘What is the legal basis that it is OK to do what we are doing with admin data and what are the ethical implications we have considered?’ ‘What commitment has Stats NZ given to respondents and data suppliers about what we are doing with admin data? What have they said? What are the key data sources?’

Kathy reviewed the draft critical path for the analysis and release of census data. Comments were made about the sensitivity of electoral data and questions were raised about the technical papers Stats NZ intended to publish.

The panel discussed the challenges of how their report is drafted in terms of the level of technical information required and the time commitments that will require, both from the panel and Stats NZ. The possibility of needing a dedicated writer was suggested. The need to consider the relative

timing of the two external reports in relation to each other and the first release of data was also discussed.

It was agreed that the panel report will need to come out around the time of first release of 2018 Census data, as it will be dependent on the need to refer to published data.

AP4-7: Gareth will share draft list of technical papers (currently being reviewed internally) with the panel to see if this list will also help the panel produce the independent report. The panel has also created a list of documents that would be helpful, so these can be compared.

11am – Methods and data update

Christine reviewed briefly the Plan B methods. This session was shortened as the Chair needed to ensure all items in the agenda for this meeting were covered at least partially. After presenting updated data, Kathy and Christine asked the panel 'what does an acceptable level of under-coverage look like' and 'what is an acceptable level of imputation'? Some members of the panel felt unprepared to give an answer and others expressed that it 'was going in the right direction'.

The panel discussed slides Christine presented on alternative sources of iwi information. Examples included 2013 Census 'codefile' data and iwi organisation lists – both were seen to have data quality issues.

The Chair noted that the iwi data did not look as if they could be improved by drawing on other sources. At this stage the iwi data did not look fit for use. The panel advised that as it is, iwi data should not be released as standard output, but could potentially be available under certain conditions to specific groups with caveats. It was acknowledged that this was a panel recommendation but that it was a Stats NZ decision on whether and how this data would be released. The panel further advised that Stats NZ consider national vs iwi specific approaches to how we communicate this. The secretariat noted that Stats NZ will come back to the panel with proposals as to how they will work with iwi on this issue.

Stats NZ participants pointed out that there is still some work to be done on iwi data, but that these are unlikely to change too much in the coming months. Output options were discussed briefly and Stats NZ will come back to the panel with a detailed evaluation and output options paper once more work had been done.

AP4-8: Gareth and Richard to consult over a when Stats NZ will return to the panel with proposals relating to the public release of iwi data.

12pm – Quality Assurance Framework and customer engagement

Gareth presented some of the slides (again truncated due to time constraints) relating to the quality framework focusing on the principles of decision making. There were questions about whether the principles had been ordered (not yet specifically). It was noted that constitutional and Treaty obligations should be at the top of the lists.

AP4-9: Gareth to update panel once more detail has been completed on the framework including an ordering of decisions making criteria.

Mike Berry and Digby Carter joined the meeting as the leads of the fit for purpose engagement team. The panel noted that the example slides did not make reference to Māori stakeholders.

AP4-10: Gareth to upload the full customer engagement spreadsheets to the workspace.

The panel discussed the publication delays and it was suggested that population estimates and projections based on these estimates could serve the purposes of some data users. Many other countries run 10 yearly (rather than 5 yearly) censuses and their key uses of population data need to live with longer intercensal periods.

There were also concerns raised about a possible judicial review and that Stats NZ needs to be well prepared for challenges stimulated by data quality issues. Mike and Digby left the meeting at the end of this session.

12:30pm – Post Enumeration Survey (PES) update

The panel was joined by Brooke Theyers and Robert Didham via video conference from Christchurch. Brooke gave an overview of the progress and issues being faced by the survey project.

There was discussion about the fact that the 2018 PES would not be able to measure Census dwelling under and over coverage. It would still be able to measure individual coverage. This was also the case in 2013 but for different reasons. The panel expressed concern about the PES missing the same dwellings as the census.

Prior to lunch and the in-committee meeting, the chair summarised some points:

- Ian would be in New Zealand for the February and March meetings.
- The day before the planned 14 Feb panel meeting, the panel would meet with the external reviewers. This would possibly be a half day and the rest of the day to be devoted to preparation and planning for the panel report.
- The February meeting needs to address legal and ethical issues.
- More information is needed about the data quality of the variables. The panel suggested they should be looking at each variable one at a time to be able to give advice.
- Information is needed about our census strategic decisions being made.
- More information is wanted about what users require and whether we can meet their needs and whether we have talked to enough key users (eg. The Health Quality and Safety Commission).

AP4-11: Kathy and Len to review whether the document created and loaded into the workspace on legal issues goes into sufficient detail about Stats NZ's legal obligations.

1-2pm – In committee meeting

When the Stats NZ participants were called back after the in-committee meeting, the Chair summarised the discussions:

- For future meetings, much more time is required in advance for panel members to read information prepared for each meeting
- The panel has not yet talked about the use of census as a periodic social survey (eg questions of activity limitation) and that the census is used as a survey frame (eg Te Kupenga) for other household surveys – and how these uses will be affected by the data quality issues.
- The panel would like more information about the quality of the administrative data that sits behind the variables. This includes the list of possible data sources, the similarity of

the concepts and the hierarchy of steps taken to improve the quality of data relating to different variables.

AP4-12: Gareth to load a document to workspace that shows variable data sources, concepts and hierarchy of steps taken to improve quality.

- As the panel is starting to put more pressure on Stats NZ for more information, is the team able to resource the questions the panel has?
- The panel discussed having an in-committee meeting in late January or early Feb in Wellington, before the meeting on 14 February, to discuss the report.
- The need to confirm the April meeting (currently targeting 10/11 or 12 April).

AP4-13: Gareth to create a table to summarise variable measures.

AP4-14: Gareth to facilitate a Jan/early Feb meeting (without Stats people in attendance).

AP4-16: Richard to contact panel about a late Jan/early Feb in-committee meeting and inform the secretariat.

AP4-17: Gareth to check with panel members about availability for the April meeting before Christmas.

The next meetings dates are:

- late January/early February, Wellington
- 13 and 14 February, Wellington
- 6 March, Auckland
- 10, 11 or 12 April
- May and later dates to be confirmed.

Action log

Ref	Date raised	Description	Owner	Date required	Progress	Date closed
AP 1-2	29/8/18	Send independent ABS report to members.	Gareth	Before Oct meeting	23/10 ABS report not yet sent given the information is sensitive. Gareth to work with Kathy and Richard on how to give access or present at future meeting. Update at Nov meeting 9/11. Paper will be added to sharepoint folder once up and running. To close before Dec meeting. 6/12 Added to workspace/Shared Documents	Close
AP 1-5	29/8/18	Give information on how respondents were to meet their legal obligations.	Gareth	Before or at Oct meeting	23/10 Adele has prepared some information, to be discussed at the informal meeting on 30 Oct. 9/11 Short paper printed and added to pack at meeting. Additional paper SNZ presented to conference to be added to sharepoint. 6/12 Added to workspace/Shared Documents	Close
AP 1-7	29/8/18	Confirm dates of next meetings.	Richard	At Oct meeting	23/10 Nov, Dec, Feb and Mar dates confirmed. April date to be confirmed. Leave open	Close

					9/11 Feb and March dates will likely include additional meetings to work on panel report and meet with external review team. Now standing agenda item. Close	
AP 1-8	29/8/18	Collate and send out information about languages (what was considered & priorities).	Gareth	Before Oct meeting	23/10 Summary not provided at Oct meeting. Will target Nov meeting. 9/11 Some information was provided with the October agenda. To be added to Sharepoint folder before Dec meeting. Additional information wanted on how the languages were selected. 6/12 Added to shared folder	Close
AP 1-9	29/8/18	Find out the response rate of the PES	Gareth	At Oct meeting	23/10 Ran out of time for PES update. To be prioritised in next 2 meetings. 9/11 Ran out of time at 9 Nov meeting, but will be added to later meeting date. 6/12 PES added to agenda for Dec meeting	Close
Meeting 2 actions						
AP 2-0	23/10/18	Revise minutes from the first meeting and present to for confirmation at the meeting on 9 November.	Richard and Gareth	By 9 Nov	9/11 To be completed by 23 Nov.	Open
AP 2-1	23/10/18	Work out way to give access to sensitive information outside of the meeting room	Kathy and Gareth	By 9 Nov	9/11 DIA Sharepoint solution approved, but not yet implemented. Target date 16 November. 6/12 Sharepoint solution created and access given to panel members	Close
AP 2-2	23/10/18	Create and distribute a conflict of interest register	Gareth	By 9 Nov	9/11 To be completed and added to Sharepoint before Dec meeting. 6/12 Added to Sharepoint/Shared Documents – 7/12 Leave action open for panel members to fill in prior to 14 Feb 2019 meeting	Open
AP 2-4	23/10/18	More information requested about what investigations we are doing into 2013 counts and response rates – are we assuming that 2013 is correct?	Gareth	By Dec meeting	9/11 Information presented that include 2013 response rates and counts. Gareth to check with Richard whether this should be closed by 23 Nov. 6/12 Gareth to discuss with Richard	Open
AP 2-5	23/10/18	Send apartment strategies (and other targeted strategies) as background to next meeting.	Gareth and Steph	By 9 Nov	9/11 To be completed and added to Sharepoint before Dec meeting. 6/12 2018 Census Targeted area slides added to workspace	Close
AP 2-6	23/10/18	Need more detail about the totality and components of the imputation methods initially	Gareth and Richard	By 9 Nov	Sessions at 30 Oct meeting and priority at full 9 Nov meeting. 9/11 Information presented at meeting. Gareth to check with	Open

		planned and now being implemented.			Richard whether this should be closed by 23 Nov. 6/12 Gareth to discuss with Richard	
AP 2-10	23/10/18	Request for data on birthplace.	Gareth	By Dec meeting	Topic for December meeting 9/11 To be presented at Dec meeting. 7/12 Data added to workspace by 7 Dec	Open
AP 2-13	23/10/18	More information needed about IDI household matching including whether there will be any more specific targeting of areas with the threshold cut-offs (have we considered using different cut-off rules for different parts of the population?).	Christine	By 9 Nov	9/11 Presentation on mitigation including imputations completed at Nov meeting. Gareth to talk with Richard about whether this should stay open. 6/12 Gareth to discuss with Richard	Open
AP 2-16	23/10/18	Re electoral implications, more information is required about the representativeness of the data and impacts of imputations. A range of scenarios, including constitutional impacts for Māori, would be useful	Kathy and Gareth	By 9 Nov	Discussion planned for 9 Nov meeting. 9/11 No additional electoral data was presented (as not complete yet). Updated draft electoral calculations to be presented to panel in Dec meeting. 6/12 Electoral data has not yet been run – targeting Feb meeting update.	Open
AP 2-18	23/10/18	Need more information about the Post Enumeration Survey methods and outcomes under the different imputation scenarios.	Kathy and Brooke	By Dec meeting	Topic for December meeting. 9/11 PES to be included in Dec meeting agenda. 6/12 added to agenda	Close
Meeting 3 actions						
AP 3-1	9/11/18	Each panel member to ensure they have a functioning RealMe username.	Panel members	By 23 Nov	6/12 Panel members to update 14/12 All members have access	Close
AP 3-2	9/11/18	Develop and distribute guidelines when file sharing solution is in place	Gareth	By 23 Nov	6/12 Brief guidelines provided via email	Close
AP 3-3	9/11/18	Agree and distribute future meeting dates by 23 November	Richard and Gareth	By 23 Nov	6/12 Feb and March dates now finalised. Now standing agenda item.	Close
AP 3-4	9/11/18	Correct minutes from 23 Oct meeting adding a note to the sentence 'that we could test the model accuracy' in addition to collecting more data from respondents.	Gareth	By 23 Nov	6/12 added, new version to be uploaded after Dec meeting.	Open
AP 3-5	9/11/18	More information about what admin data is used in the method and for what purpose. Privacy Impact Assessment update. Add to agenda for December.	Gareth	By 7 Dec	6/12 Did not have time for this item in the Dec agenda. Will present information in Feb.	Open
AP 3-6	9/11/18	Check the table stating the percentage of the IDI_ERP	Christine	By 7 Dec	To be completed	Open

		using different admin sources as data does not look right.				
AP 3-7	9/11/18	More information needed about the sources and component of admin data used to help fill gaps in Māori descent data.	Christine	23 Nov	6/12 included in Dec presentation	Open
AP 3-8	9/11/18	For future data presentations, request that any data created to Territorial Authority level, that we include Auckland Local Boards.	Gareth	By 7 Dec	6/12 Noted	Close
AP 3-9	9/11/18	More information needed about the sub-types of Non-Private Dwellings (NPDs). Check when this detail will be available for the panel and add to sharepoint folder when ready.	Gareth	By 21 Dec	6/12 Info not yet available, can target Feb or Mar meeting	Open
AP 3-10	9/11/18	Clarification is needed about what data is used in the census administration enumeration (referred to as IDI data in the presentation), and a list of the current variables being imputed, where it comes from, whether the data suppliers are aware of its use and whether it uses identifiable or de-identified person data.	Christine and Kathy	By 7 Dec	6/12 Leave open, not addressed yet	Open
AP 3-11	9/11/18	Present criteria about the thresholds being used to make decisions about methods.	Gareth and Christine	By 7 Dec	6/12 Some information in Dec meeting present, more info to come after meeting. Leave open.	Open
AP3-12		Panel members to think further about going back into the field and whether they had any further advice for us (as they didn't think they had time to appropriately digest and respond at the meeting).	Kathy	By 7 Dec	6/12 Check with panel about whether there was any more feedback. 14/12 Panel unable to comment on this yet with only a brief discussion in November. The panel needs more information from Stats NZ on what sorts of options exist for collecting further data from the field. Kathy to report back to February or March 2019 meeting.	Open
AP 3-13	9/11/18	Agree priority of topics for Dec meeting.	Richard	By 23 Nov	Close	Close
AP 3-14	30/10/18	The Dwelling Frame evaluation report to be shared with the q/a panel	Gareth	14 Feb 2019		Open
AP 3-15	30/10/18	Provide information on births and removals from the Dwelling frame during the live operation	Gareth Chris H	14 Feb 2019		Open
AP 3-16	30/10/18	Produce an estimate of population at small geographies by applying the average household size from 2013 census to the number of	Adele	14 Feb 2019		Open

		dwelling on the dwelling frame.				
AP 3-17	30/10/18	Produce a matrix showing the counts of people listed on the dwelling questionnaire against the number of individual questionnaires	Adele	14 Feb 2019		Open
AP 3-18	30/10/18	Confirm the source of local estimates of those born overseas (e.g. in Auckland)	Gareth	14 Feb 2019		Open
AP 3-19	30/10/18	Provide the panel with information on staff shortages at local levels of geography – ideally in a way that identifies the impact on workloads	Gareth	14 Feb 2019	13/12 Gareth: Suggest this is out of scope but in scope of the external review and to close action	Open
AP 3-20	30/10/18	Report back on how might the problems with the scanning field staff recruitment vendors impact on response rates?	Gareth	14 Feb 2019	13/12 Gareth: Suggest this is out of scope but in scope of the external review and to close action	Open
AP 3-21	30/10/18	Share paper with the panel on the imputation approach and the CPT recommendations on which admin variables to use for imputation. Ideally also to include a flow chart of the process.	Gareth	14 Feb 2019		Open
AP 3-22	30/10/18	Elaboration of the options around imputation – with the pros and cons of each option and the impacts on users spelt out (maybe in a table with a Red/Amber/Green status?)	Christine	14 Feb 2019		Open
Meeting 4 actions						
AP 4-1	7/12/18	Ensure all panel members have shared workspace write-access and items are labelled appropriately.	Gareth	By 21 Dec	13/12 Panel members now given write access. Documents to be renamed by 21 Dec	Open
AP 4-2	7/12/18	Secretariat to ensure all documents have useful headers and footers so once open it is clear what panel members are reviewing.	Gareth	By 21 Dec	13/12 Noted for future attachments. All current docs to be updated by Xmas	Open
AP 4-3	7/12/18	Create and load document with Internet Collection System screen shots for panel members.	Adele	By 14 Feb meeting	18/12 Two documents (AP4-3a and AP4-3b) uploaded to workspace with screenshots. Will leave open until Feb meeting for panel let know whether there is enough information.	Open
AP 4-4	7/12/18	Add link to Privacy Impact Assessment to shared workspace.	Gareth	By 21 Dec	13/12 Added to Shared folder	Close
AP 4-5	7/12/18	Document how multiple de-identified data points in admin sources have been protected from identification once they are assembled.	Gareth/Adele	By 14 Feb meeting		Open
AP 4-6	7/12/18	Document 'What is the legal basis that it is OK to do what we are doing with admin data	Christine and Kathy	By 14 Feb meeting		Open

		and what are the ethical implications we have considered?' 'What commitment has Stats NZ given to respondents and data suppliers about what we are doing with admin data? What have they said? What are the key data sources?'				
AP 4-7	7/12/18	Share draft list of technical reports with the panel to see if this list will also help the panel produce the independent report. The panel has also created a list of documents that would be helpful, so these can be compared.	Gareth	By 14 Feb meeting		Open
AP 4-8	7/12/18	Consult over a when Stats NZ will return to the panel with a decision about public release of iwi data	Richard and Gareth	By 14 Feb meeting		Open
AP 4-9	7/12/18	Update panel once more detail has been completed on the quality framework including an ordering of decision making criteria.	Gareth	By 14 Feb meeting		Open
AP 4-10	7/12/18	Upload the full customer engagement spreadsheets to the workspace.	Gareth	By 21 Dec		Open
AP 4-11	7/12/18	Discuss with Len after the Dec meeting whether the document 'Information census legislative obligations – DRAFT 5 Dec 2018' loaded into the workspace goes into sufficient detail about Stats NZ legal obligations.	Kathy and Len	By 21 Dec		Open
AP 4-12	7/12/18	Create a table to summarise variable data sources, concepts and hierarchy.	Gareth	By 14 Feb meeting		Open
AP 4-13	7/12/18	Create a table to summarise variable quality measures.	Gareth	By 14 Feb meeting		Open
AP 4-14	7/12/18	Facilitate set-up of an in-committee meeting (without Stats people in attendance) in late Jan or Feb 2019.	Gareth and Sophie	By 21 Dec	13/12 Room in Wellington Stats office and travel booked for Auckland people coming. Food and room access remaining actions.	Open
AP 4-15	7/12/18	Create glossary for Stats NZ acronyms and load to workspace	Gareth	By 14 Feb meeting	13/12 Started and added to Shared folder	Close
AP 4-16	7/12/18	Contact panel about a late Jan or early Feb 2019 in-committee meeting and inform the secretariat.	Richard	By 21 Dec	13/12 Chair has set date of 5 Feb and agreed with panel members	Close
AP 4-17	7/12/18	Check panel members availability for April meeting.	Gareth	By 21 Dec		Open