

OC191228

28 January 2020

Rodney Yeoman
fyi-request-11740-71c6da9f@requests.fyi.org.nz

Dear Mr. Yeoman,

I refer to your request of 26 November 2019 under the Official Information Act 1982 (the Act), seeking the following information relating to the "Economic Analysis of Upper North Island Supply Chain Scenarios" report by Ernst Young for the Upper North Island Supply Chain Strategy Working Group:

- 1) *Was there an independent peer-review of the Ernst Young report?*
- 2) *If there was an independent peer-review please provide the memo/emails/reports that outline the findings.*
- 3) *Did the Working Group provide feedback on the Ernst Young report?*
- 4) *If there was feedback from the Working Group please provide the memo/emails/reports that outline the findings.*
- 5) *Did the economist on the Working Group review the Ernst Young report?*
- 6) *If the economist on the Working Group reviewed the the EY report please provide the memo/emails/reports that outline the findings..*
- 7) *Did Ministry of Transport or any other ministry review the Ernst Young report?*
- 8) *If there was a review by any ministry please please provide the memo/emails/reports that outline the findings.*

The Working Group was appointed by Cabinet in 2018 to independently review New Zealand's freight and logistics sector for the Upper North Island, including ports, and develop a proposed Upper North Island Supply Chain Strategy (UNISCS).

The Ministry of Transport supports the UNISCS through its role as Secretariat to the Working Group, and as a Ministry of State in providing advice on aspects of policy, legislation and regulation. The Secretariat provides data and administrative support to the Working Group. Economic analysis of the Upper North Island Supply Chain Scenarios was commissioned by the Secretariat on behalf of the Working Group and development of this, was led by Ernst & Young. Members of the Working Group provided independent feedback on the draft report in their capacity as members of the Working Group.

Our response to this OIA is relevant for the period 3 July 2019 when the initial draft report was received by the Working Group from Ernst Young, to 26 July 2019, when the final report was received by the Working Group. Our response to your above questions are therefore as follows:

- 1) *Was there an independent peer-review of the Ernst Young report?*
No, the draft report was reviewed only by the UNISCS Working Group and Ministry of Transport in its capacity as Secretariat to the UNISCS Working Group.
- 2) *If there was an independent peer-review please provide the memo/emails/reports that outline the findings.*
N/A

3) Did the Working Group provide feedback on the Ernst Young report?

Yes

4) If there was feedback from the Working Group please provide the memo/emails/reports that outline the findings.

Feedback from the Working Group in the form of memo/emails/reports are provided.

5) Did the economist on the Working Group review the Ernst Young report?

Yes

6) If the economist on the Working Group reviewed the EY report please provide the memo/emails/reports that outline the findings.

Feedback from the Working Group Economist Shane Vuletich (on 4 July 2019) is provided

7) Did Ministry of Transport or any other ministry review the Ernst Young report?

The Ministry of Transport reviewed the report in its capacity as Secretariat to the UNISCS Working Group only.

8) If there was a review by any ministry please provide the memo/emails/reports that outline the findings.

Feedback from the Secretariat (Dan Jenkins) 9 July 2019 and 25 July 2019 is provided.

The documents in scope are detailed in the table below:

	Title	Date	Author	Document type	Notes
1	UNI Ports Report - DRAFT MASTER v18 COPY TO USE.docx (includes Document 'UNI Ports Report - DRAFT MASTER v18 COPY TO USE')	3/07/2019	Chris Money	Email	Released in full
2	Re: UNI Ports Report - DRAFT MASTER v18 COPY TO USE.docx	3/07/2019	Wayne Brown	Email	Released in full
3	Re: UNI Ports Report - DRAFT MASTER v18 COPY TO USE.docx	4/07/2019	Wayne Brown	Email	Released in full
4	UNISCS Report	4/07/2019	Shane Vuletich	Email	Released in full
5	Re: UNISCS Report	4/07/2019	Wayne Brown	Email	Released in full
6	RE: Uniscs Report (includes Document 'UNI Ports Report - DRAFT MASTER to Working Group Monday 8 July.docx')	8/07/2019	Chris Money	Email	Released in full
7	Re: Uniscs Report	9/07/2019	Wayne Brown	Email	Released with redactions under section 9(2)(g)(i)
8	Re: Uniscs Report (includes document 'UNI Ports Report - DRAFT MASTER to Working Group Monday 8 July DAN')	9/07/2019	Dan Jenkins	Email	Released in full

9	RE: Uniscs Report (includes document 'UNI Susan Comments - DRAFT MASTER to Working Group Monday 8 July)	11/07/2019	Susan Krumdieck	Email	Released in full
10	Fwd: Uniscs Report from EY dated 8 July	11/07/2019	Greg Miller	Email	Released in full
11	Re: Long bloody emails (includes document 'UNI Susan Comments - DRAFT MASTER to Working Group Monday 8 July)	14/07/2019	Susan Krumdieck	Email	Released with redactions under section 9(2)(g)(i)
12	Uniscs Report	21/07/2019	Vaughan Wilkinson	Email	Released in full
13	UNI Ports Report - DRAFT MASTER to Working Group 23 July.docx (includes document 'UNI Ports Report - DRAFT MASTER to Working Group 23 July)	23/07/2019	Chris Money	Email	Released in full
14	EY report	24/07/2019	Wayne Brown	Email	Released in full
15	RE: UNI Ports Report - DRAFT MASTER to Working Group 23 July.docx	25/07/2019	Dan Jenkins	Email	Released in full
16	RE: UNI Ports Report - DRAFT MASTER to Working Group 23 July.docx	25/07/2019	Chris Money	Email	Released in full
17	Re: UNI Ports Report - DRAFT MASTER to CoDE_DH Edits v6 - Copy	26/07/2019	Wayne Brown	Email	Released in full
18	Re: UNI Ports Report - DRAFT MASTER to CoDE_DH Edits v6 - Copy	26/07/2019	Vaughan Wilkinson	Email	Released in full
19	Re: UNI Ports Report - DRAFT MASTER to CoDE_DH Edits v6 - Copy	26/07/2019	Dan Jenkins	Email	Released in full
20	Re: UNI Ports Report - DRAFT MASTER to CoDE_DH Edits v6 - Copy	26/07/2019	Vaughan Wilkinson	Email	Released in full
21	Final Report (includes document 'final report')	26/07/2019	Chris Money	Email	Released in full

Certain information is being withheld under section 9(2)(g)(i) of the Act, which relates to maintaining the effective conduct of public affairs through the free and frank expression of opinions by or between or to Ministers of the Crown or members of an organisation or officers and employees of any department or organisation in the course of their duty.

In regard to the information that has been withheld under section 9 of the Act, I am of the opinion that there are no countervailing considerations that make it desirable, in the public interest, to make the information available.

You have the right under section 28(3) of the Official Information Act to make a complaint about the withholding of information to the Ombudsman, whose address for contact purposes is:

The Ombudsman
Office of the Ombudsmen
P O Box 10-152
WELLINGTON

The Ministry publishes our Official Information Act responses and the information contained in our reply to you will be published on the Ministry website. Before publishing we will remove any personal or identifiable information.

Yours sincerely



Bryn Gandy
Deputy Chief Executive – Strategy and Investment